

The Use of Narrative Features to Reframe Egypt Military Coup News

Rina Fajrin

English Language and Literature
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia
rina.jeandini.fajrin3@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This present research examined narrative features used to reframe Egypt military coup news. The data were in the form of two articles taken from Al-Arabiya as the source texts and two articles taken from Kompas as the target texts. This research employed qualitative approach and descriptive method as research design and textual analysis to collect the data. To analyse the data, this research used narrative theory proposed by Baker (2010a). According to the results, this research showed that narrative features used are selective appropriation, temporality, and relationality. Selective appropriation is the most frequently used in this study which means that the texts were purposively selected to represent the target text news agency. By using temporality, the texts underwent an adjustment of time with the time in the target texts. In addition, temporality also made the texts reveal a distance between the readers and the place where the incident happened. Furthermore, by applying relationality, the texts underwent an adjustment with the understanding which existed in the target texts. Based on the findings, this study concludes that Al-Arabiya tended to support Ikhwanul Muslimin and Kompas tended to support Egypt military.

Keywords: *Narrative, Narrative Features, Reframing, and News.*

INTRODUCTION

News may not be delivered as it is. It takes some efforts to present news. One of the efforts can be in the term of reframing news. The way how the news is reframed can be critically discussed and revealed by exploring narrative features. Exploring narrative features is one of the ways in narrative theory to reveal reframing strategies in a news article (Baker, 2010a). Narrative features themselves are divided into four kinds (Baker, 2010b). Those are selective appropriation, relationality, causal emplotment, and temporality. Subsequently, this research examined narrative features used to reframe Egypt military coup news. Two news articles were selected from Al-Arabiya as the source texts and two news articles were selected from Kompas as the target texts. Furthermore, in the end of this research, the conclusion will be drawn.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Narrative and Narrative Features

Narrative proposed by Baker (2010a) can take the form of daily stories of

some people. They can be some factual stories which are experienced by people. Since the stories are in the form of factual stories, the stories can change dynamically depend on people who experience them. Those changes are also explored by some translators and interpreters to frame or reframe the stories or the narratives (Baker, 2006). Therefore, framing or reframing can assists narrative to explore how the same narratives can be framed or reframed in different ways by different narrators (or translators) (Baker, 2008).

Furthermore, narrative which associates with Baker's (2010a) work has several types and several features. The types of narrative are personal narrative, disciplinary narrative, meta-narrative, and public narrative. Personal narrative is narrative of an individual. It means that an individual is the subject of the narrative (Baker, 2006). Baker (2006) explains that personal or ontological narrative is personal story which tells personal's self, like his place in the world and his personal history. Furthermore, disciplinary narrative or conceptual narrative as Somers and Gibson

(1994) state in Baker (2006) is some concepts and explanations that construct social research. Disciplinary narratives can also be defined as “the stories and explanations that scholars in any field elaborate for themselves and others about their object of inquiry” (Baker, 2006, p. 6). Then, meta-narrative is the potent public narratives which persist over long periods of time and influence the lives of people across a wide range of settings (Baker, 2006). In another word, meta-narrative can be called as a historical experience or a knowledge experienced by many people in the world (Lyotard, 1979). Meanwhile, public narrative is groups of narratives which are larger than individual, such as families, religious and educational institutions, a political or activist group, media, nations and larger entities (Baker, 2006). Somers (1992) in Baker (2006) says that the example of public narrative stories is “Freeborn Englishman”. The other examples that are closed with people’s mind are public narratives of 11 September 2001 and Iraq war (Baker, 2006). Perhaps in people’s mind, there are

many questions about who was responsible, why it happened, could it have been avoided, how many died, how well or badly were things going in the accident of 11 September 2001 and Iraq (Baker, 2006). Furthermore, the kind of narratives analyzed in this research is public narrative since it discusses about a group of narrative.

Subsequently, the features of narrative in narrative theory are relationality, causal employment, temporality, and selective appropriation. Relationality means that an event in narrative cannot stand alone. It demands a relationship with the other events in the other narratives (Baker, 2010a). To reveal the relationship, selecting some words which are common in the culture of a target text or selecting some words which can describe the frames of narratives and which have existed in the culture of a target text can be implemented (Baker, 2006). It means that a translator does not need to translate a word if it has been accepted in the culture of a target text (Baker, 2006). Moreover, to reframe news by applying relationality can be done by adding some information or

events that have a relation with the news (Baker, 2006). It is in line with Somers (1997) in Baker (2005) who states that some events in narratives must be interpreted within a larger configuration of events. Furthermore, causal emplotment allows a translator to take the same set of events and weave them into different 'moral' stories (Baker, 2006). To weave the same set of events into different moral stories, a translator can add a cause for the set of events (Baker, 2006). Subsequently, that cause helps the translators decide what course of action they should take in events or narrative (Baker, 2006). Temporality means that narratives are meaningful when they are placed in the temporal moment and embedded in space and time (Baker, 2007 as cited in Septaviana, 2014). Therefore, narratives need spatial words and temporal words to build themselves (Baker, 2006). Spatial words and temporal words can be used to reframe a text (Baker, 2006). Furthermore, temporality does not only talk about spatial words or temporal words, but also how a news agency selects the news in the

appropriate time (Baker, 2006). It means that the news has to be the highlighted news (discussed by many people) (Baker, 2006). Selective appropriation is a narrative feature which is used by a translator to omit or add some paragraphs in a text (Baker, 2006). Beside omitting or adding some paragraphs, selective appropriation can also assist the translator to select some texts or articles which are appropriate with the perspective of translator's news agency (Baker, 2006).

Reframing in Translation News

Reframing is a new interpretation of framing text or original text (Agne, 2007). Kaufman and Smith (1999) also states that reframing consists of some attempts to alter someone else's frame. In addition, Darwish (2006) adds that reframing is when an article is translated into another language and the perspective of target language news agency is included when the article is translated. According to those explanations, reframing text can be in the form of the new version of framing text and the translated news. This research took translated news as

the object of study. Since the translated news undergoes a reframing process, the translated news is not neutral (Hatim & Mason, 1997). The translated news could be biased (Devaney, 2013). It means that it probably has a tendency to represent one of parties in the news. Therefore, reframing can be used as a strategy in winning public's support (Friedman, 2005; Anis, 2006; Bani, 2006; and Ilyas, 2010). In addition, news functions as a tool for spreading information to society (Hohenberg in Chaer, 2010). It also means that translated news can lead public's opinion.

RESEARCH METHOD

Textual Analysis

According to the results, narrative features found are selective appropriation, temporality, and relationality. Causal employment was not found in the texts. Therefore, the analysis will be presented based on the features found.

Selective Appropriation

Selective appropriation is a narrative feature which is used to omit or add

some paragraphs in a text (Baker, 2006). Selective appropriation has a big influence to reveal the perspective of the author of the text (Baker, 2006). Especially in media, the translator of news in media can delete some texts which are not appropriate with his news agency or add some texts to manipulate the news (Baker, 2006). Omission and addition are the kinds of selective appropriation. Besides omission and addition, selective appropriation also includes how a news agency selects several news articles which will be translated based on the perspective of the news agency (Baker, 2006). Furthermore, the analysis of selective appropriation will be divided into two parts. Those are omission and addition found in the texts.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Omission

Omission found emerges in the texts below.

Source Text 1

A leading Qatar-based cleric declared in a religious edict, or fatwa, on Saturday that Egyptians should support ousted President Mohammed Mursi of the Muslim Brotherhood and the military

should withdraw from the political scene.

Target Text 1

KAIRO, KOMPAS.com - Seorang ulama berpengaruh di Timur Tengah, Sabtu (6/7/2013), mengeluarkan fatwa bahwa rakyat Mesir harus mendukung Muhammad Mursi dan mendesak militer mundur dari panggung politik negeri itu.

In the texts above, the word “president” was found in the source text. However, in the target text, it was not found. According to the source text, the word “president” is stated before the ousted president’s name “Mohammed Mursi”. It could indicate that in the source text, Mursi was probably still regarded as a president. Meanwhile, in the target texts, Mursi was not regarded as a president anymore. The omission of the word “president” did not only occur in the target text above. It also occurred in all parts of articles which report about the ousted president “Mohammed Mursi”.

Apart from the word “president”, another omission was also found in another text. The omission found is the omission of paragraphs.

Source text 2

On Sunday, authorities in Alexandria said that it will deploy its security forces after Islamist groups such as the Muslim Brotherhood, from which Mursi hails, called for a protest in Sidi Jaber.

“Our duty is to secure the protesters and people living in the area. We will work to separate people in case clashes occur,” Al-Dostor newspaper reported General Amin Izzadin as saying.

On Friday, clashes between opponents and supporters of Mursi flared in Egypt, killing at least 46 people nationwide, with the heaviest death toll registered in Alexandria.

Those paragraphs stated above did not exist in the target text. The paragraphs were omitted since they mostly discussed about authorities who were involved in the incident. It seems that the translated text was made to focus on anti-Mursi activists who were thrown off the building. In addition, the word “authorities” in the title of this text was omitted. It also probably influenced the text which was translated. Since the word “authorities” was not translated, the paragraphs which talked about authorities were not translated too.

According to the results of this research, the omission of words more frequently appears than the omission of paragraph. It indicated that the omission of word can probably describe more news agencies' tendencies than the omission of paragraphs. It also means that the text can probably be the representation of news agency if that text uses words to reframe itself.

Addition

Addition was found in the texts below.

Source text 2

One of the young men was killed. He was identified as the 19-year-old Hamada Badr. Activists say he was celebrating Mursi's ouster when he came into encounter with Muslim Brotherhood supporters.

Target text 2

Salah satu pemuda yang dilempar itu tewas. Pemuda itu kemudian diketahui sebagai Hamada Badr berusia 19 tahun.

Kelompok anti-Mursi mengatakan, kedua pemuda itu merayakan tergulingnya Mursi di atap gedung tersebut sebelum para pendukung Ikhwanul

Muslimin kemudian naik ke atap gedung dan melemparkan kedua pemuda itu.

According to the texts above, addition emerges in the target text. Interestingly, the target text was divided into two paragraphs. It means that when the source text was translated, the text was divided into two paragraphs. To divide the text, the sentence was added. The sentence added is "*sebelum para pendukung Ikhwanul Muslimin kemudian naik ke atap gedung dan melemparkan kedua pemuda itu*" (before the supporters of *Ikhwanul Muslimin*, then they went to the top of building and threw the two men off). The sentence added seems to explain the chronology of the incident. In addition, the sentence also seems to be made to emphasize the incident occurred at that time.

Another addition was found in another part of the target text 2. The addition was found in the caption of the target text 2. The evidence is delivered below.

Source text 2

The 19-year-old Hamada Badr was killed after being thrown off a building in Alexandria by

what appeared to be an Islamist supporter of ousted President Mohammed Mursi. (Photo courtesy: activists)

Target text 2

Foto ini menampilkan cuplikan peristiwa saat para pendukung Muhammad Mursi melemparkan dua orang pemuda anti-Mursi dari atap sebuah gedung di Alexandria, Mesir. Inset: Hamada Badr (19), salah seorang pemuda yang dilempar dari atas gedung Al Arabiya

The sentence “*foto ini menampilkan cuplikan peristiwa*” (this photo shows the part of the incident) and the phrases “*salah seorang pemuda yang dilempar dari atas gedung*” (a young man who was thrown off the building) and “*dua orang pemuda anti-Mursi*” (two young men of anti-Mursi activists) were added into the caption. By using the sentence “*foto ini menampilkan cuplikan peristiwa*”, the caption had been made to attract the readers in order to see the photo closer. Meanwhile, by adding the phrase “*salah seorang pemuda yang dilempar dari atas gedung*”, the caption had been emphasized and the emphasis could help the readers remind who Badr (the man who was

thrown off the building) was. In addition, “*dua orang pemuda anti-Mursi*” was added because that phrase could remind the readers that there is not only Badr who became the victim, but his friend also became the victim.

To summarize, several sentences and phrases tended to be added into the text which explored the violence made by Mursi activist or *Ikhwanul Muslimin*. It is proven from the sentence and the phrase added in the caption of target text 2. The sentence and the phrase seem to attract the readers in order to see the photo closer since the photo shows the violence made by Mursi activist. In the paragraphs of target text 2, the sentence added attempts to exaggerate the violence made by Mursi activist.

After discussing about addition, this study comes to conclude selective appropriation found in this study. Based on the results, selective appropriation which was most frequently used is omission. It occurred probably because the texts were not appropriate with the perspective of news agency so that

they were deleted. Meanwhile, addition is only applied if there is a paragraph or a phrase that is appropriate with the perspective of news agency. So that, omission preferred to be used. Additionally, as it has been mentioned above, selective appropriation not only discusses about omission or addition but also how a news agency selects several news which are translated. In this case, two texts were selected to be translated from the news agency of source texts. Those texts were considered to be translated, since they are probably the representatives of the news about Egypt military coup.

Temporality

Temporality means that narratives are meaningful when they are placed in temporal moments and embedded in space and time (Baker, 2007 as cited in Septaviana, 2014). Therefore, narratives need spatial words and temporal words to build themselves (Baker, 2006). Moreover, spatial words and temporal words can also be used to reframe a text (Baker, 2006). Additionally, temporality does not only discuss about spatial words or

temporal words, but also how a news agency selects the news in the appropriate time (Baker, 2006). It means that the news has to be the highlighted news (discussed by many people) in that time (Baker, 2006). Furthermore, there are several temporal words and spatial words found. The explanation is explained below.

Temporal Words

Temporal words are used to adjust the time where the source text is distributed with the time where the target text is distributed (Baker, 2006). In source text 1 and target text 1, the temporal words were found in the timeline which was attached. Source text 1 issued the news on Saturday, 6 July 2013. Meanwhile, target text 1 issued the news on Sunday, 7 July 2013. It proves that the timeline had been changed. The change occurred, since the time in source text 1 was not appropriate with the time in target text 1. Although, the news was the up-to-date news, but the place of source text news agency and the place of target text news agency are different. Therefore, the timeline

in the news had to be adjusted based on the timeline in the target text news agency. This was conducted since the readers need up-to-date information.

Spatial Words

Spatial words in a translation are used when some words which refer to spatial words are not available in a source text, but a target text needs them to reframe the text (Baker, 2006). Spatial words can be in the form of the name of place or a referenced word (Baker, 2006). Below, there is a spatial word which was found.

Source Text 1

Reuters, Riyadh

A leading Qatar-based cleric declared in a religious edict, or fatwa, on Saturday that Egyptians should support ousted President Mohammed Mursi of the Muslim Brotherhood and the military should withdraw from the political scene.

TargetText 1

KAIRO, KOMPAS.com

-
Seorang ulama berpengaruh di Timur Tengah, Sabtu (6/7/2013), mengeluarkan fatwa bahwa rakyat Mesir

harus mendukung Muhammad Mursi dan mendesak militer mundur dari panggung politik negeri itu.

In the source text and the target text above, spatial words were only found in paragraph one. Those are “Reuters, Riyadh” which was translated as “*Kairo, Kompas.com*” and “*negeri itu*” (in English, that country). In reference to <http://english.alarabiya.net>, *Al-Arabiya* is a news agency based in Dubai, United Arabs Emirats. In its news, *Al-Arabiya* always discusses issues about Arab world. Probably, *Al-Arabiya* reports the news about Arab world in English, in order to bridge the West and the Arabs. Therefore, *Al-Arabiya* puts the city where this news agency circulates its news, “Riyadh”. Another reason, “Riyadh” was stated in the source text, probably because Qaradawi issued the fatwa in Riyadh, Saudi Arabia. Reuters was attached in the source text because the news was probably taken from Reuters. However, “Reuters, Riyadh” was not stated in the target text. It was changed as “*Kairo*” (in English,

Cairo) and *Kompas.com*. It was changed because the news discusses about Egypt and the news agency which distributed the news is *Kompas*. Furthermore, the words “*negeri itu*” (that country) were added since those words could emphasize what Qardawi said in fatwa. In addition, by adding the words “*negeri itu*”, a distance had been made between the readers and Egypt (the place where the incident took place).

After discussing about temporality, this research comes to conclude that temporality which is most frequently used in this study is temporal words. It could occur since the texts underwent an adjustment of time with the time in the translated texts news agency. So that, the texts insisted to become the up-to-date news. Furthermore, spatial words had made the news articles delivered by the source texts news agency become the news of translated text news agency. By changing the place and adjusting the time, the news about Egypt military coup became different with the original one. However, temporality does not only mean that

the place and the time are changed. Temporality also means that a news article is chosen since the news is up-to-date information. The news about Egypt military coup had become the highlighted issue as this study was conducted. Therefore, the news about Egypt military coup was probably initiated to be explored.

Relationality

Relationality means that an event in narrative cannot stand alone; it demands a relationship with the other events in the other narratives (Baker, 2010a). To reveal the relationship, selecting some words which are common in the culture of a target text or selecting some words which can describe the frames of narratives and which have existed in the culture of a target text can be implemented (Baker, 2006). Furthermore, there is relationality found in this study. One of them is delivered in the source text and the target text below.

Source Text 1

A leading Qatar-based cleric declared in a religious edict, or fatwa, on Saturday that Egyptians should support ousted President Mohammed Mursi of the

Muslim Brotherhood and the military should withdraw from the political scene.

Target Text 1
KAIRO, KOMPAS.com
– Seorang ulama berpengaruh di Timur Tengah, Sabtu (6/7/2013), mengeluarkan fatwa bahwa rakyat Mesir harus mendukung Muhammad Mursi dan mendesak militer mundur dari panggung politik negeri itu.

In the source text, the word “fatwa” is explained by adding the phrase (a religious edict). It proves that the word “fatwa” is not familiar with the English readers yet. Though, the source text is circulated in the Middle East, however the readers of this news are foreign people. Meanwhile, the target text is made for the Indonesian readers, so that, the words used had been adapted with Indonesian’s culture. Furthermore, the word “fatwa” had been adapted as an Indonesian word, so that that word insisted to be used. In addition, there is no semantic equivalent of the word “fatwa” in *Bahasa Indonesia*. Indonesian readers understand the meaning of the word “fatwa” because it has been naturalized as part of

Bahasa Indonesia. To conclude, relationality in this study is the least frequently used feature. It could occur, since relationality does not fully reveal the perspective of target text (Baker, 2006). It is different with selective appropriation.

Discussion

After analyzing the four texts, this research concludes that selective appropriation is most frequently used feature in the texts. It could occur since it is easier to reframe news by applying selective appropriation (Baker, 2006). In addition it is in line with Baker (2006) who stated that selective appropriation is most frequently used feature. By applying selective appropriation, the texts can directly be omitted if some paragraphs or some words are not appropriate with the perspective of news agency or they are not coherence with the titles of the texts (Baker, 2006). Moreover, the texts can be added if the texts are appropriate with the perspective of translated texts news agency (Baker, 2006). It is conducted to emphasize what the source text had stated.

Furthermore, in reference to the results, *Kompas* tended to support Egypt military and *Al-arabiya* tended to support Ikhwanul Muslimin.

Overall, what *Al-Arabiya* and *Kompas* did is only to attract their readers. By exploring some narrative features, they would probably like to ensure the readers and invite the readers to follow their perspective. What they did is also in line with Friedman (2005), Anis (2006), Bani (2006) and Ilyas (2010) that framing and reframing can be used as a strategy in winning public's support.

CONCLUSION

Selective appropriation, temporality, and relationality were used to reframe the translated texts. Selective appropriation is the most frequently used feature. It is in line with what Baker (2006) stated that selective appropriation is most frequently used feature, since several words or texts can directly be omitted if they are not appropriate with the perspective of news agency. In addition, they can directly be added if they are appropriate with the perspective of news agency. By

adding several texts, the texts can be emphasized. In the translated texts, several words and several texts were not translated from its source texts. The words deleted can attract the readers to support Ikhwanul Muslimin. Furthermore, the texts which were not translated are deemed not appropriate with the titles of the news which were created. According to the results, to make news represent the tendency of news agency, some information can be added into the news. One of the news articles analyzed underwent an addition. The addition can support the tendency of news agency. Furthermore, by applying selective appropriation, the news articles were purposively selected to represent the translated news agency. Besides using selective appropriation, to reframe the news, temporality and relationality can be used. By using temporality, the time in the source texts had been adjusted with the time in the target texts, so that the readers got the up-to-date news. By using temporality too, a distance between the readers and the place where the incident happened had been made. In relationality

aspect, several words and several phrases were not translated. Most of them are the explanation of the words which had existed in the source texts. It could occur since those words have been naturalized into Bahasa Indonesia. Furthermore, by applying relationality, the texts underwent an adjustment with the understanding which existed in the target texts.

After analyzing some narrative features found in this study, this study concludes that Al-Arabiya tended to support Ikhwanul Muslimin (Mursi activists) and Kompas tended to support Egypt Military (anti-Mursi activists). What Al-Arabiya and Kompas did is only to attract their readers. By exploring some narrative features, they would probably like to ensure the readers and invite the readers to follow their perspective. What they did is also in line with Friedman (2005), Anis (2006), Bani (2006) and Ilyas (2010) that framing and reframing can be used as a strategy in winning public's support.

Subsequently, this research still has some weaknesses. It only focused on exploring narrative features. The further research is

expected to explore linguistics devices used and non-linguistics devices used in framing or reframing news. Additionally, the object of study can be added. This study only analyzed four online news articles from two news agencies. The next researchers are expected to analyze more than four news articles or they can analyze several articles translated by one news agency, so that the research about reframing news will be more enriched.

REFERENCES

- Agne, R. R. (2007). Reframing Practices in Moral Conflict: Interaction Problems in The Negotiation Standoff at Waco. *Discourse & Society*, 18(5), 549-578.
- Baker, M. (2005). *Targamat al-sardiyyaat/Sardiyyaat al-targama (Translation of Narratives and Narratives of Translation)*, translated by Hazem Azmy. *Fossoul*, 66(3), 21-34.
- (2006). *Translation and Conflict: a Narrative Account*, New York: Routledge
- (2008) *Ethic Renarration – Mona Baker Is Interviewed by Andrew Chesterman*. *Cultus*, 1(1) 10-33.
- (2010a). *Critical Readings in Translation Studies*, New York: Routledge

- (2010b). Narratives of Terrorism and Security: 'Accurate' Translation, Suspicious Frames. *Critical Studies in Terrorism*, 3(3), 347-364.
- Chaer, A. (2010) *Bahasa Jurnalistik*. Jakarta: PT Rineka Cipta.
- Darwish, A. (2006). Translating the News Reframing Constructed Realities. *Translation Watch Quaterly* 2(1), 52-94
- Devaney, H. (2013). *Perception of Media Bias: Viewing the News through Ideological Cues*. (Unpublished thesis). University of California, San Diego
- Kaufman, S. and Smith, J. (1999). Framing and Reframing in Land Use Change Conflict. *Journal of Architectural and Planning Research*, 16(2), 164-178.
- Lyotard, J. F. (1979). *The Postmodernism Condition*, Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Sani, B. (2006). An Analysis of Press Translation Process. In Conway, K. and Bennet, S. (Eds), *Translation in Global News* (Pp. 35-46). University of Warwick: United Kingdom.
- Septaviana, S. (2014). Student Interpreters' Narrative Performance. *TransCon2014*, 1-14.