

An Analysis of Translating Strategies on Apprenticeship Students' Translation Products in Pikiran Rakyat Newspaper Company

Kaisan Rifki Al-Ma'ruf
English Language and Literature
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia
kaikeepmoving@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The research aims to discover the types of translation strategies which were found in apprenticeship students' translation products and to assess the students' English-Indonesian translation quality by asking five English students to rank the students' translation products. This research employs the theory of translation strategy proposed by Vinay and Darbelnet (2000) and Sara Bani (2006). The criterias that are used to assess the apprenticeship students' translation products are proposed by Barnwell (1980 as cited in Larson, 1984). Descriptive Qualitative study approach by Cresswell (2002), was used as the research design of the research. There are 172 selected phrases which were analyzed by the research. The result reveals that the most frequently used translation strategy is *Calque* (45.35%), then it was followed by *Borrowing* (29.65%), *Adaptation* (8.14%), *Equivalence* (6.40%), *Substitution* (4.66%), *Generalization* (2.33%), *Transposition* (1.74%), and *Inclusion of Explanation* (1.74%). The result also shows that (77.78%) of text was cut by the translators to eliminate the information that is too detail and unimportant, then to remove the information that had been covered by the previous sentences, and to cut the sensitive issue that may cause misconception to the readers. Most of participants thought that the translation products were good and understandable. However, the participants thought that the translation products are not natural since the translators used too much *Calque* translation strategy in translating the text.

Keywords: *Translation Strategies, Translation Quality, Vinay and Darbelnet (2000), Bani (2006)*

INTRODUCTION

Translating a news article is not an easy work because it deals with specific terms and some journalism rules that must be obeyed by the translators. Moreover, the translators must be aware of the context of the news. Thus, skillful translators are needed to translate news articles. However, not all news translation products are accurate. Research done by Akhiroh (2010) said that some Indonesian translations in news are not good. The research shows that 27.5% of translations in *Seputar Indonesia* newspaper are less accurate and 10% of the translations are not accurate.

English students who have a chance to be translators seem to have weaknesses in translating news articles. Therefore, it is necessary to disseminate the knowledge of translating strategies to translators so that they will be more aware of the strategy that they choose. One of the factors that can help to improve the translators' skill is by knowing the fundamental translating strategies, such as the translating strategies proposed by Vinay and Darbelnet

(2000) and Bani (2006). Moreover, preliminary observation shows that the apprenticeship students do not really know the procedures that they use in translating the articles. By knowing these strategies, the translators can be more responsible in deciding the right term and perform better translation.

There are many studies which analyze the types of translating strategies in web pages, manual books, and novels. For examples, the analysis in Compaq Notebook manual by Yulistina (2009) shows that 'transference' is the most frequent procedure applied because there are many terms and words which are the names of invention, brands, devices and acronyms; translation analysis in Twitter web pages by Kamil (2014) shows that 'literal translation' is the most frequent procedure applied in Twitter web pages, followed by Couplets and Triplets, and Naturalization; translation methods and procedures analysis in Friendster web pages by Herdianti (2009) shows that the most frequent strategy which is used is couplets. The finding shows that the

words were difficult to translate only with single procedure.

Unfortunately, it is difficult to find the accessible research which analyzes the apprenticeship students' translation products. Meanwhile, the research is very important to enlighten the students about the kind of translating strategies that is appropriate to translate the news articles. The research aims to find the types of translation strategies which were found in apprenticeship students' translation products and to assess the students' English-Indonesian translation quality by asking five selected participants to rank the students' translation products.

This research analyzes the translating strategies used by English Language and Literature students who were in apprenticeship program in one of newspaper companies in Bandung, Pikiran Rakyat. It focuses on the translation strategies found in selected noun phrases. It is important to delimit the analysis in noun phrases level because the field of the procedure analysis is in phrase unit (Newmark, 1988). Moreover, noun

phrases analysis can represent the meaning of sentence and can simplify the analysis. Vinay and Darbelnet (2000) and Bani (2006) translation theories are used in the research.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Equivalence-Based Theory

Equivalence based theory is a movement in translation theories that connects the SL and TL in entire level and in unit level by considering the degree of correspondence (Munday, in Kamil, 2014). The word 'equivalence' is derived from the words 'equal' and 'value'. Meaning that translation which follows the equivalence based theory as its paradigm must translate the source text to the target text equally with the same value (Pym, 2010).

The theory is firstly proposed by a Russian-born American structuralist, Roman Jakobson. He followed the idea of Saussure (1916) about signify and signifier. He thought that the meaning from a person can be transferred to other person even if the other person never knows the signifier of the concept

(Hatim & Munday, 2000). From that point, as seen in his paper at 1959, Jakobson began to consider the equivalence in meaning between words in different languages.

The equivalence based theory tries to translate a SL into TL by keeping both message, form, and style of the text. Consequently, the translators also have to make the equivalence in level of linguistic and semantic. In this point, the translation will be challenging, since there are many varieties in grammar.

Vinay and Darbelnet Translation Strategies

1. Borrowing

This translation means that the SL is transferred directly into TL. This kind of translation may be found in all language, including Bahasa Indonesia. For example the word *laptop* in English is translated as *laptop* in *Bahasa Indonesia*. The purpose is to fill the semantic gap between two languages.

2. Calque

Calque is similar to Borrowing. The translation basically transfers the

language too, but the translation is adjusted to the target language. For example, the word *telepon pintar* in *Bahasa Indonesia* which came from English word *smartphone*. Then the word phrase was translated literally. Vinay and Darbelnet noted that both *Borrowing* and *Calque*, are integrated with TL.

3. Literal Translation

Vinay and Darbelnet (in Hatim and Munday, 2000, p. 37) claim that "Literal translation is the most commonly used by many people". This translation is similar to word to word translation. However, there are some cases that make the literal translation becomes unacceptable. The reasons are:

- (a) It gives different meaning;
- (b) It has no meaning;
- (c) It is impossible for structural reasons;
- (d) It 'does not have a corresponding expression within the metalinguistic experience of the TL;
- (e) It corresponds to something at a different level of language.

4. Transposition

Transposition is a change of one part of speech for another without changing the sense. Vinay and Darbelnet (1995, p. 94) said that "transposition maybe the most common structural change done by the translators". The change also exist in form of grammar, such as singular become plural, the change in position of adjective, changing the word class, a word become a phrase, and a phrase become a clause.

5. Modulation

Modulation is a strategy that describes the situation of SL with different point of view. Even if the translation is literally and grammatically correct, it is still considered as unidiomatic and awkward in the TL (Hatim and Munday, 2000).

6. Equivalence

Equivalence strategy is a strategy that describes a same situation by different stylistic or cultural mean. It can be occurred because the translators want to keep the beauty of the text, so the TL can feel the same meaning. Equivalence strategy is

usually used to translate the idiomatic expression. Even if the translation is not acceptable literally, the meaning and the beauty of the text is still the same.

7. Adaptation

Adaptation is a strategy that brings a change of cultural reference when the situation of SL does not exist in TL. So the translators have to adapt the SL and reproduce the cultural words that exist in TL. The examples are the words 'nasi', 'ketupat', and 'lontong' in *Bahasa Indonesia*. If the translator wants to translate those words into English, he must translate it into word 'rice', because those words do not exist in English.

Sara Bani's Translation Strategies

1. Cutting or Summary

Cutting or Summary strategy is used to translate a text when the cultural element is simply eliminated or synthesized. It happens when the text is not considered to be significant inside the translated article.

2. Inclusion of Explanation

This kind of strategy simply explains the cultural elements through a paraphrase or circumlocution inside the text. The explanation is added to the text to keep the cultural element. The purpose is to make the text become easier to be understood by the public.

3. Generalization

Generalization strategy is used to make the cultural element more general.

4. Substitution

Substitution strategy is used when the cultural element is not that familiar to the public. Thus, the cultural element is replaced by another functionally equivalent element which is familiar to the public.

Criteria of a good translation

There are many theories proposed by some experts, but this research takes two theories to simplify the assessment. The theories proposed are by Larson (1980) and Barnwell (in Larson, 1984). Larson (1984),

proposed three characteristics of a good translation, they are:

1. Using the normal language forms of the receptor language
2. Communicating as much as possible to the receptor language speakers the same meaning that was understood by the speakers of the source language.
3. Maintaining the dynamics of the original source of language text.

Barnwell (1980 in Larson, 1984), stated that there are 3 main aspects of a good translation, which are:

1. Accuracy
2. Clarity
3. Naturalness

In assessing the translation quality, the research used a rubric of translation quality proposed by Barnwell (in Eristianingrum, 2014).

METHODOLOGY

This research employed descriptive qualitative method with quantitative statistical analysis to find the pattern of the data frequency. The method was used because the research did not only find out the most frequent strategies used by the students but also assess their translation products.

According to Creswell, qualitative research has the perspective from the center stage in the unfolding model of inquiry (Creswell, 2002). In a qualitative method, the key to gather the information are interviews and discussion (Regmi et al, 2010). Thus, the method was used because the research assessed the students' translation products.

The data were taken from BBC, Reuters, Yahoo, Mirror, Autoweek, VOA News, The Guardian, Fox News, and CBS News (Source Text) and the apprenticeship students' translation products (Target Language). In analyzing the data, the source texts and the target texts were juxtaposed to make the analysis easier. After that, the data were analyzed by using Vinay and Darbelnet (2000) and Bani (2006) translation strategy theories to find the most frequent strategy found in the translation products. After that, the translation products were assessed by five English students.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

Based on the translation strategy theories proposed by Vinay and

Darbelnet (2000) and Bani (2006), there are nine kinds of translation strategies found in apprenticeship students' translation products. The strategies are *Borrowing*, *Calque*, *Transposition*, *Equivalence*, *Adaptation*, *Inclusion of Explanation*, *Cutting*, *Generalization*, and *Substitution*. The total amount of translation strategies found in the translation products are 172 phrases.

To gain this data, Vinay and Darbelnet (2000) and Bani (2006) translation strategies were applied to classify the types of translation. The result was found after calculating the occurrence of strategy usage by using the formula. The finding shows that *Calque* translation strategy is the most frequent strategy found in apprenticeship students' translation products with 78 occurrences (45.35%). Then it is followed by *Borrowing* with 51 occurrences (29.65%), *Adaptation* with 14 occurrences (8.14%), *Equivalence* with 11 occurrences (6.40%), *Substitution* with eight occurrences (4.66%), *Generalization* with four occurrences (2.27%), *Transposition*

and *Inclusion of Explanation* with three occurrences (1.74%).

Cutting was used when there are cultural elements which are eliminated or synthesized when the cultural elements are not significant in the translated article (Sara, 2006). There are 14 articles (77.78%) articles with cutting. The example is: ST : In several Twitter posts, he said the game's removal was not due to legal issues and that he may make a sequel. Mr Dong, who describes himself as a "passionate indie game maker", also said on the micro-blogging site that he will not sell Flappy Bird but that he will still make games. Flappy Bird creator Dong Nguyen announced his plan to remove the game via social media site Twitter

TT : Dalam beberapa kicauannya di *Twitter*, penghapusan *game* ciptaannya bukan disebabkan masalah hukum. Bahkan mungkin, ia akan membuat kelanjutan dari *Flappy Bird*. Dong juga menyebutkan bahwa dia tidak akan menjual *Flappy Bird*, tetapi akan tetap membuat *game*.

The underlined sentence was cut by the translator. Apprenticeship students' translation products have their own pattern in cutting the articles. First is that the *Cutting* was used to eliminate the information that is too detail and unimportant. Second, it was used to eliminate the information that had been covered by the previous sentences. Last, *Cutting* was used when there is a sensitive issue that may cause misconception to the readers.

After finding the translation strategies found in students' translation products, this research then assessed the quality of the translation. Most of interviewee thought that the translation products are quite good because the translation products are understandable. The translators can maintain both meaning and form of the original text. Most of the translations had fulfilled the criteria of a good translation which are *Accuracy*, *Clarity*, and *Naturalness* (Larson, 1984).

The assessment interview shows that 43.81% of students' translation products are excellent,

32.19% are good, 18.67% are fair, and 5.33% are bad. In other words, the translation had fulfilled the criteria of a good translation that was proposed by Larson (1984) and Barnwell (1980 as cited in Larson 1984).

However, there are some words that are not accurate based on the interviewee's opinion. Aulia, a participant, stated that the words 'Mozarella bubbles' which is translated into 'pelepuhan keju' is not appropriate because the word 'pelepuhan' is not usually used to describe the condition of cheese. In *Bahasa Indonesia*, the word 'pelepuhan' usually is used to describe the skin, or something which is solid at first, then is broken because of something which is hot. So, the translation became unnatural. Moreover, the word 'bubbles' does not really equal to word 'pelepuhan' because 'bubbles' means something which is very hot then it produces some bubbles. Thus the meaning becomes unclear and unacceptable as well.

CONCLUSION

The result shows that there are nine translation strategies found in apprenticeship students' translation products, which are *Calque*, *Borrowing*, *Adaptation*, *Equivalence*, *Substitution*, *Transposition*, *Generalization*, and *Inclusion of Explanation*. The most frequent strategy that was found in the translation products is *Calque* translation strategy with 78 occurrences (45.35%). The next position is *Borrowing* with 51 occurrences (29.65%). The third position is *Adaptation* with 14 occurrences (8.14%). Then it was followed by *Equivalence* strategy with 11 occurrences (6.40%). The next position is *Substitution* strategy with eight occurrences (4.66%). The seventh position is *Generalization* strategy with four occurrences (2.33%). The last position is *Transposition* and *Inclusion of Explanation* both with three occurrences (1.74%).

Based on the findings above, *Calque* translation strategy becomes the most frequent strategy because *Calque* strategy is practical. *Calque* can link the source language and

target language very well by maintaining both form and meaning from the text. Moreover, there are many terms that have no equivalence in *Bahasa Indonesia*, so the translators must use *Calque* in translating the texts. This phenomenon indicates that the source texts that were taken by the students have many specific terms that have no equivalence in *Bahasa Indonesia*. Second, this phenomenon also reveals that *Calque* translation strategy had been used by Indonesian people in daily communication.

The second conclusion is about the quality of apprenticeship students' translation products. This data were collected by using the theory of a good translation proposed by Larson (1984), the rubric for the translation was taken from Barnwell (in Eristyaningrum, 2014). After finding the quality of apprenticeship students' translation products, the interview was held to ask the assessor comment and suggestion for the translation products and the translators as well.

In general, the quality of students' translation products is

good. The interview showed that most of interviewee thought that the translation products are good and easy to understand. Moreover, the translation products can transfer the context from the SL into TL which may avoid the misleading to the readers. However, the translators seems did not put their real effort to translate the articles. It could be seen from the most frequent strategy that was used to translate the articles, which is *Calque* strategy which simply adapted the SL into TL. It shows that the translators did not really select the most appropriate translation for the text.

There are some suggestions that were needed for the readers who want to make this research as the basics for their research. First, is data collection. It is better for the next researchers to increase the amount of sample for the research. 18 articles were enough, but perhaps the next researchers can add at least one translation for each participant. It means that the sample can be 24 articles. The more sample, the more data will be varied.

Second, apprenticeship students' translation products analysis is a new issue in translating research. Perhaps the next research may analyze the translation strategy of apprenticeship students' translation products by using other theories which may give different result to the research. Third, still in taking the sample of translation, perhaps the next researchers may select one or two genres for the sample. It may focus the research and may simplify the research.

Fourth, in assessing the apprenticeship students' translation products, it is better for the next research to hold a pre-test for the translators. Then hold the post-test for the translators after giving some theories about the criteria of a good translation. It may give a new issue about how the information of a good translation may affect to apprenticeship students' translation products.

REFERENCES

- Akbari, M. (2013). *Strategies for Translating Idioms*. Tehran: Islamic Azad University
- Akhiroh, N. (2010). *Analisis Kesepadanan Makna Terjemahan Berita Internasional yang Terbit di Koran Seputar Indonesia*. Surakarta: Universitas Sebelas Maret
- Allatief, M. (2012). *The Analysis of Translation Methods and Procedures in Facebook*. Bandung: Indonesia University of Education
- Barratt, H (2009). *Methods of Sampling from a Population*. Retrieved February 16, 2015, from <http://www.healthknowledge.org.uk/public-health-textbook/research-methods/1a-epidemiology/methods-of-sampling-population>
- Bassnett, S. (2002). *Translation Studies*. New York: Routledge.
- Crabtree, B. (2006). *Qualitative Research Guidelines Project*. Retrieved February 13, 2015, from <http://www.qualres.org/HomeSemi-3629.html>
- Creswell, J W. (2012). *Research Design*. Boylston Street, Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.
- El Shafey, F.A.M. (1985). *Compounding in English and Arabic, Implications for Translation Methodology* M.A Thesis, Faculty of Arts, Cairo University.
- Erstianingrum, Y. (2014). *An Analysis of Translation Procedures of Medical Terms in A Medical*

- Textbook Entitled
 "Introduction to Human
 Physiology" By Laura Lee
 Sherwood. Bandung:
 Universitas Pendidikan
 Indonesia
- Hamzah, A. (2011). *PENILAIAN
 KUALITAS
 TERJEMAHAN (Studi
 Kasus Terjemahan Fiqh Al
 Islam Wa Adilatuh Bab
 Salat Pasal 1 Karya Dr.
 Wahbah Al-Zuhaili.*
 Jakarta: UIN Syarif
 Hidayatullah Jakarta
- Hatim, B & Munday, J. (2001).
*Introducing Translation
 Studies.* London:
 Routledge
- Jabir, J, K. (2006). *Skopos Theory:
 Basic Principles and
 Deficiencies.* Basrah:
 University of Basrah
- Kamil, M A. (2014). *An Analysis of
 English-Indonesian
 Translation Procedures on
 Twitter Web Pages.*
 Bandung: Indonesia
 University of Education
- Larson, M.L. (1984). *Meaning Based
 Translation (A Guide
 Cross-Language
 Equivalence).* New York:
 University Press of
 America
- Massoud, M. (1995). "Producing
 Realizable Translations in
 a Culturally-globalized
 world" English Language
 in 2000, Proceedings of
 the 14th National
 Symposium of English
 Language Teaching,
 CDELT, Ain Shams
 University, Cairo.
- Munday, J. (2001). *Introducing
 Translation Studies:
 Theories and Applications.*
 Oxon: Routledge.
- Newmark, P. (1988). *A Textbook of
 Translation.* London:
 Prentice Hall International.
- Ni, L. (2009). *For "Translation and
 Theories".* Harbin: CCSE
- Nugraha, B. (2015). *An Analysis of
 English Indonesia
 Translation Procedures on
 Google Mail Web Pages.*
 Bandung: Universitas
 Pendidikan Indonesia
- Olenka, F. (2014). *An Analysis on
 Translation Techniques In
 The Subtitle of The Movie
 "5CM".* Malang:
 Universitas Brawijaya
- Pirnajmuddin, H. (2012). *A Study of
 The Translations of Terms
 Related to Practical Laws
 of Religion (furu al-din):
 Raising Students'
 Awareness of Culture-
 Bound Items.* Isfahan:
 University of Isfahan
- Pym, A. (2010). *Exploring
 Translation Theories.* New
 York: Routledge
- Regmi, K. (2010). *Understanding the
 Processes of Translation
 and Transliteration in
 Qualitative Research.*
 London: Regmi
- Reuters. (2013). *Interest in Different
 Types of News.* Retrieved
 February 23, 2015, from
<http://www.digitalnewsreport.org/survey/2013/interest-in-different-types-of-news-2013/>
- Swandi, A. (2012). *Teknik
 Penerjemahan.* Retrieved
 August 31, 2015, from

<https://barokpotter.wordpress.com/2012/03/12/teknik-penerjemahan/>

Wikipedia. (2014) Retrieved September 2, 2014, from http://id.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pikiran_Rakyat