AN ANALYSIS OF A TERTIARY EFL LEARNER'S REVIEW TEXT USING TRANSITIVITY SYSTEM

Hesti Tri Wigati* and Norhasanah

English Language Study Program, Faculty of Language and Literature Education,
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Jl. Dr. Setiabudhi 229, Bandung, West Java, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

This paper aimed to identify the schematic structures and the linguistic features of the review text. In this case, the linguistic features of the review text were analyzed by using a transitivity system of functional grammar developed by Halliday. The method used in this study was qualitative. The case study approach was used in this study in which a review text written by a university student was analyzed. The text entitled the Struggle of Setting the Truth Free: A Literary Response to Agus Noor's *"Kartu Pos dari Surga"*. The result revealed that the text had followed the common generic structure of review text and its social purpose.

INTRODUCTION

One of many variations of text genre is a review text. It is used to give criticism of artwork or events to the public audience (Gerot & Wignell, 1995, p. 171). Moreover, the Systemic Functional Grammar model proposes the concept that language is used as functional, related to communication purposes where humans use the language in their social situations or contexts that they inhabit; for example, to explain to others, to entertain people, to instruct, and to describe something (Derewianka & Jones, 2010). Among various types of text, review text is considered challenging because it is usually used in daily life. In the review text we could evaluate a publication, such as a book, a video game, a musical composition, or a movie; a piece of hardware like a car, home appliance, or computer; or a special event or public performance, such as a play, a live music concert, a dance show, or a musical theatre show. Given the situation above, this paper tried to analyze a review text using the Systemic Functional Linguistics framework as a way of analyzing text based on the context and meaning. The generic structures of review text are orientation, interpretative recount, evaluation, and evaluative summation (Gerot & Wignell, 1995, p. 171). This generic structure is simplified by Christie & Derewianka (2008, p. 61-62) which mention that review has three elements: 1) *the context*, which provides essential contextual information about the text, 2) *text description*, which introduces characteristics and some details of the plot, and 3) *text judgment*, which offers the reviewer's evaluation of the text. In addition, the social function of a review text is to provide a critique of a public event or an artwork. Such work of art includes concerts, exhibitions, ballets, TV shows, short stories, movies, plays, books, operas, and recordings (Gerot & Wignell, 1995). Moreover, the review text has significant lexicogrammatical features which are: 1) focus on particular participants, 2) direct expression of opinions, 3) long and complex

---

* Corresponding author email: hesti@upi.edu

clauses, and 4) metaphorical language (Gerot & Wignell, 1995, p. 171-172). Furthermore, the linguistic features in this review text are analyzed by using a transitivity system of functional grammar, which has been developed by Halliday (1994). The motive of transitivity system selection is that transitivity could find and explain the linguistic features from certain texts and because the elements such as participant, process, and circumstance of time and place could be identified by using these transitivity theories (Eggins, 2004). One way to understand how clauses are used to represent entities of the world is by using transitivity analysis. As a clause may contain participant(s), process(es), and circumstance(s), transitivity describes how those parts are organized by a writer to achieve a certain goal. Different types of the process will involve different types of participants and thus yield different meanings. In total, there are six types of process in transitivity analysis, namely material, relational, mental, verbal, behavioral, and existential.

Based on the description above, this study aimed to identify the schematic structures and the linguistic features of the review text written by a university student using the transitivity system. This text analysis is one of the final assignments in the SFL course. Hence, the text is also discussed in Fadhillah & Rahmadina (2022) and Fitriana (2022). In addition, the result of this text analysis is expected to give the knowledge for students in analyzing the review text by using the transitivity system. For scholars, it can enrich their insight about SFL theories. It is also expected to make us aware that functional grammar should be known and learned by many teachers and practitioners in the educational world.

METHODS
This study aimed to analyze a review text from the SFL perspective which described and interpreted the linguistic resources. The research was conducted using a qualitative design. A case study was employed since this study tried to analyze a review text. The case study is an appropriate method to analyze explanatory questions of social phenomenon (Hamied, 2017). The data collecting technique used in this study was analyzing a review text of a university student. The content analysis was based on the social function of the text, the structure of the organization, and the Transitivity system of functional grammar.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION
This section discussed the findings related to the text analysis. Firstly, the text was analyzed its social function. The next discussion was describing the structure of the organization. Finally, it was analyzed using a transitivity system of functional grammar.

Social Function
The text of "*The Struggle of Setting the Truth Free: A Literary Response to Agus Noor's Kartu Pos dari Surga*" belongs to the book review. It was obviously stated in the title that was *A **Literary Response** to Agus Noor's Kartu Pos dari Surga.* The book review has a social function which is to give some critiques for an artwork or public event and in this text, the writer wanted to express her ideas and opinions for a short story written by Agus Noor. The artwork was placed in paragraph one *the struggle of keeping and telling the truth is experienced by Marwan, the father of Beningnya in Agus Noor's **short story** "Kartu Pos dari Surga".* It functions as the response in the review text. Response explains and puts the work based on its particular and general situation and context; it is usually by comparing it with other works of its kind or through analog with an event or a non-art object (Gerot & Wignell, 1995). The text also compared the artwork to the other artwork as stated in *A similar kind of struggle is experienced by John Proctor who is a farmer in "The Crucible", a play by Arthur Miller* and also writer's own experience in a real-life *as for myself, I have experienced multiple incidents where I had to struggle between choosing to tell the truth or to just hide it.* The social purpose of review text was also implied in the text as the SFG model constructs the ideas that language should be functional; it has to link the language with communication purposes and in which humans use the language within varied

social contexts where they inhabit; for example, to explain, to entertain people, to describe a particular thing, to instruct others, etc. (Derewianka & Jones, 2010).

Structure of Organization
Generic Structure
The text followed the generic structure of the review text. Christie & Derewianka (2008, p. 61-62) mention that review has three elements: 1) *the context*, which provides essential contextual information about the text, 2) *text description*, which introduces characteristics and some details of the plot, and 3) *text judgment*, which offers the reviewer's evaluation of the text.

Table 1. Generic Structure of the text "The Struggle of Setting the Truth Free"

No.	Review elements	Parts of the text
1.	Context	The struggle of keeping and telling the truth is experienced by Marwan, the father of Beningnya in Agus Noor's short story "*Kartu Pos dari Surga*". Though lying might spare one's feelings, the damage that it causes after can be worse than what we could imagine.
2.	Text description	How lies can worsen things is portrayed clearly in the story. Agus Noor illustrates how Marwan, as a parent struggles in answering his innocent daughter's question regarding her mother's missing letter which she has always been waiting for but has not arrived yet. His intentions might be kind, but what he did actually made things worse. This is shown when Beningnya finds out that the letter she receives the next day was not from her mother.
3.	Text Judgement	Lying might seem to solve a problem at first, especially when we are trying to consider one's feelings, but it is not rare to see things become messed up when the truth is finally set free after being hidden underneath a pile of lies. Agus Noor, in his short story "*Kartu Pos dari Surga*" beautifully depicts and teaches us how lying can turn a situation to become worse and that the truth will always find its way out on the surface.

The table showed the generic structure of the review text. Firstly, the artwork was placed in paragraph one *the struggle of keeping and telling the truth is experienced by Marwan, the father of Beningnya in Agus Noor's short story "Kartu Pos dari Surga"*. It functions as the response in the review text. Her response in this short story could be seen in a particular and general context, and usually being compared with other works in its kind or by analog with an event or a non-art object (Gerot & Wignell, 1995). This review tried to critique Agus Noor's short story "*Kartu Pos dari Surga*". In her review, the reviewer did not only explore the message in the story; she also convinced the readers that *we have to tell the truth even when it is hard*. She proposed her arguments by comparing it with another story "The Crucible" and her own life experience. It could be seen from her arguments on the text:

> *A similar kind of struggle is experienced by John Proctor who is a farmer in "The Crucible", a play by Arthur Miller.* (Text to text comparison)

> *As for myself, I have experienced multiple incidents where I had to struggle between choosing to tell the truth or to just hide it.* (Text to life comparison)

The next generic structure of review text is text description. It was shown in paragraphs two, three, and four. In paragraph two, the writer summarized the plot of the main text. While in

paragraph three it showed the summary of the compared text. And the last was in paragraph four, it told the experience that the writer felt in the story. The last generic structure of review text is text judgment. It gives the evaluation for the artwork and/or its production or performance and it is usually recursive (Gerot & Wignell, 1995). The writer was successfully giving her opinion toward the book *Agus Noor, in his short story "Kartu Pos dari Surga"* **beautifully depicts** *and teaches us how lying can turn a situation to become worse and that the truth will always find its way out in the surface.* The judgment was also well-written by giving a solved problem by iteration in *Lying might seem to solve a problem at first, especially when we are trying to consider one's feelings. But, it is not rare to see things become messed up when the truth is finally set free after being hidden underneath a pile of lies.*

In addition, this text was also completed by textual evidence which had the functions to support the arguments (judgment) of the reviewer and to show the readers that the information was factual from the source.

Textual evidence

Marwan tak berani menatap mata anaknya, ketika Beningnya terisak, dan berlari ke kamarnya. Bahkan membohongi anaknya saja ia tak bisa! Barangkali memang harus berterus terang. Tapi bagaimanakah menjelaskan kematian pada anak seusianya? Rasanya akan lebih mudah bila jenazah Ren terbaring di rumah. Ia bisa membiarkan Beningnya melihat Mamanya terakhir kali. Membiarkannya ikut ke pemakaman. Mungkin ia akan terus-terusan menangis karena merasakan kehilangan. Tetapi rasanya jauh lebih mudah menenangkan Beningnya dari tangisnya, ketimbang harus menjelaskan bahwa pesawat Ren jatuh ke laut, dan mayatnya tak pernah ditemukan.
"Saya ndak tahu mesti jawab apa…"
"Saya tak menyangka, betapa soal kartu pos ini akan membuatnya mesti mengarang-ngarang jawaban."
"Marwan melihat mata Beningnya berkaca-kaca. "Ini bukan kartu pos dari Mama!" Jari mungilnya menunjuk kartu pos itu. "Ini bukan tulisan Mama…"

Besides review, this text was also a *personal response*, a simple attitudinal response to a text (Christie, Frances & Derewianka, 2008, p. 59). Here, the reviewer tried to identify "the message of the text" or "the values embedded in the text". Christie, Frances & Derewianka (2008) also state that a personal response has a simpler schematic structure than a review which only consists of *response* and *evaluation*, and this text included these two elements.

Linguistics features

This text had significant lexicogrammatical features of review text which were: 1) focus on particular participants, 2) direct expression of opinions, 3) long and complex clauses, and 4) metaphorical language (Gerot & Wignell, 1995, p. 171-172). Particular participants in this story were Marwan and her daughter, Beningnya. Direct opinions were given by the reviewer in many parts of this text. Some of them could be seen from these general statements:

Agus Noor illustrates how Marwan, as a parent struggles in answering his innocent daughter's question regarding her mother's missing letter.

His intentions might be kind, but what he did actually made things worse.

This points out how the truth will eventually come out even after how hard we pour our effort into covering it.

Agus Noor, in his short story "Kartu Pos dari Surga" beautifully depicts and teaches us how lying can turn a situation to become worse and that the truth will always find its way out on the surface

Long and complex clauses could be found even at the beginning of this text, "*When we love someone, oftentimes we care about their feelings too much, we believe that it is best to hide the truth from them to spare their feelings*". We could see how complex this sentence was; we could even separate it into some clauses:

1. When we love someone (adverbial clause)
2. oftentimes we care about their feelings too much (independent clause)
3. we believe (independent clause)
4. that it is best (dependent clause)
5. to hide the truth from them (non-finite clause)
6. to spare their feelings (non-finite clause)

This complex sentence indicated that the reviewer had good competency in writing. She could construct and combine all those dependent clauses with the independent ones. Non-finite clauses appear as a sign of compactness (Greenbaum & Quirk, 1990). Derewianka (2011, p. 99) mentions that non-finite clauses have the characteristic of more natural and compacted written language and are also more efficient and economical. She also states that non-finite clauses are typically used as a sign of maturity. Thus, she suggests students should be encouraged to observe and employ them where appropriate. Moreover, Butt et al. add that non-finite clauses are ways of making meanings unavailable for arguments or discussions (2000, p. 127). Besides independent and dependent clauses, the appositive phrase also appeared, and it added complexity to the text. It could be seen from this sentence "The struggle of keeping and telling the truth is experienced by Marwan, the father of Beningnya in Agus Noor's short story "*Kartu Pos dari Surga*"."; the underlined part of the sentence was an appositive phrase that provided more information about Marwan.

The last linguistics feature was metaphorical language. It could be seen from this statement "*the truth is finally set free after being hidden underneath a pile of lies*". The sentence could actually be simplified by "*The truth is finally revealed* ", but the reviewer wanted to convey colorful writing; so then, she used metaphorical language. Halliday (1985, p. 320) states that lexical metaphor is a variation of wordings in which the meaning of the words is realized differently from their congruent meaning.

Transitivity analysis

The last analysis was identifying the text from the SFL perspective. In this analysis, the linguistic features of this review text had been analyzed by using a transitivity system from functional grammar theories which had been developed by Halliday (1994). The main reason for the researchers in choosing transitivity was because transitivity could find and explain the linguistic features from varied texts and because the main elements of clauses like the participant, process, and circumstance (time and place) could be evaluated by looking into the transitivity concepts (Eggins, 2004). The first element in the transitivity system used to analyze was the participant. The participants in this text were mostly concrete… *When we love someone, oftentimes we care about their feelings too much, we believe that it is best to hide the truth from them to spare their feelings*. However, there were also some abstract participants stated in the text… *How lies can worsen things is portrayed clearly in the story… His intentions might be kind… One simple instance is when I lied to my parents… Lying might seem to solve a problem at first*. The next transitivity system used to analyze was the process. Some types of processes appeared in the text; they were material process, mental process, verbal process, and relational process. The process is the essential part of the sentence, as it is mentioned that process is the center of an English clause (Emilia, 2014).

The transitivity system explains the grammar of experiential meaning where our experience could be well managed within a clear set of process types (Halliday, 1994). As can be seen in Table 2, material processes were mostly shown in this text. So, we could conclude that most participants in the text were actors, but there were other participants like senser, sayer, and carrier. Eggins (2004) defines material process as the process of doing and it indicates the action. There were a

total fifty-nine of material processes in the text. Material processes were shown mostly in the text… *The struggle of keeping and telling the truth is experienced by Marwan… How lies can worsen things is portrayed clearly in the story.* Hasan (1985b, p.40) mentions that material processes are close to the action and important in many text types (Droga & Humphrey, 2003, p.30).

Table 2
The Number of Transitivity Used in the Text

Process types	Material	Mental	Verbal	Intensive	Possessive	Behavior	Exist.
Total	59	10	11	27	-	-	-

Besides material processes, mental processes, like *love, care, believe,* and *imagine* also appeared in some clauses. They encode the meanings of feeling and thinking (Eggins, 1994, p. 240). There were ten mental processes found in the text… *we believe that it is best to hide the truth from them… After that, we thought about watching a movie together in the cinemas.* Mental processes could be used where the characters or writer want to evaluate or reflect upon what has happened by expressing their feelings and thoughts (Emilia, 2014). The next process that appeared in the text was the Verbal process. Verbal processes can be used to project second-order representations of experience (William, 1993, p. 234). Here, the reviewer used verbal processes to retell what Beningnya asked her father regarding her mother's missing letter and what Marwan said and admitted after hearing that question. The Verbal processes appeared eleven times in the text…*When every time Beningnya asks why the letter has not arrived yet, he says, "Saya ndak tahu mesti jawab apa…".* Furthermore, Verbal processes are processes of saying, or more accurately, of symbolically signaling (Gerot & Wignell, 1995). The last process found in the text was the Relational process. Relational processes are processes of being (Halliday, 1994). Relational processes appeared twenty-seven times… *One simple instance is when I lied to my parents …when I was in junior high school.* Relational processes could also be seen from these clauses: *"His intentions might be kind ", "John Proctor who is a farmer in "The Crucible", "his motive was to save his own life", "when I was in junior high school"*, etc. These processes complete the text by giving identity, role, and meaning to the participants (Emilia, 2014, p. 159). The reviewer's ability and knowledge in using varied kinds of processes and word choices indicated that she had a good competency in thinking and writing; it could be seen from a higher level of language used and the complexity of sentences shown in the text. The last element which should be discussed in the transitivity system concept was circumstances. Circumstantial meanings are usually expressed through prepositional phrases or adverbial groups (Eggins, 1994). There were many circumstances found in the text… *in time the truth will prevail itself in sorts of ways … How lies can worsen things is portrayed clearly in the story.* Circumstances played a very significant role in creating text. It could be seen that the text showed various kinds of circumstances like duration, place and time, manner, reason, contingency, accompaniment, role, matter, and angle (Emilia, 2014, p. 167). In short, text analysis using the Transitivity system could be considered effective since the text succeeded to achieve the purposes and the message that the reviewer wanted to convey. The purposes could be seen from Lexicogrammatical features of review text by showing particular participants, direct expression of opinions, and the use of elaborating and extending clause and group complexes to package the information (Gerot & Wignell, 1995).

CONCLUSION
Based on the analysis of the review text, some conclusions can be drawn. First, in terms of social function, the writer already showed the social purpose of the review text. The social purpose of the review text was also implied in the text as the SFG model explains the significant ideas that language should be functional; it relates to the language purposes and is used in various humans' social contexts and conditions where they inhabit (Derewianka & Jones, 2010). Second, the text could be categorized as a good review text because the schematic structure constructed in the text had followed the common generic structure of the review text. It included response/evaluation,

context, text description, and text judgment (Christie & Derewianka, 2008, p. 61-62). Finally, through the Transitivity system, the text could be considered effective because the text had succeeded in achieving its purposes. The purposes could be seen from Lexicogrammatical features of review text by showing particular participants, direct expression of opinions, and clause and group complexes in organizing the information (Gerot & Wignell, 1995).

REFERENCES

Butt, D., Fahey, R., Feez, S., Spinks, S., Yallop, C. (2000). 2nd Edition. *Using functional grammar. An explorer's guide.* Sydney: National Centre for English Teaching and Research. Macquarie University.

Christie, Frances & Derewianka, B. (2008). *School Discourse: Learning to write across the years of schooling.* Continuum International Publishing Group.

Derewianka, B., & Jones, P. (2010). *From Traditional Grammar to Functional Grammar: Bridging the Divide*: Research Online.

Derewianka, B. (2011). *A new grammar companion for teachers*. Sydney: PETA.

Droga, L.& Humphrey, S. (2003). *Grammar and meaning. An introduction for primary teachers.* Berry, NSW: Target Texts.

Eggins, S. (2004). *An Introduction to Systemic Functional Linguistics*. 2nd edition. London: Continuum.

Emilia, E. (2014). *Introducing Functional Grammar.* Bandung: Pustaka Jaya

Fadhillah, A., M. & Rahmadina, K., P. (2022). *An Analysis of Interpersonal Meaning in A Tertiary Student's Literary Response Text.* Manuscript submitted for publication.

Fitriana, W. (2022). *An Analysis of Student's Literary Response Text Using SFL.* Manuscript submitted for publication.

Gerot, L., & Wignell, P. (1995). *Making Sense of Functional Grammar.* Australia: An Introductory Workbook.

Greenbaum, S. & Quirk, R. (1990). *A student's grammar of the English language*. London: Longman.

Hamied, F.A. (2017). *Research Methods: A Guide for First-Time Researcher.* Bandung: UPI Press

Halliday,M.A.K (1985). *An introduction to Functional Grammar.* London: Edward Arnold

Halliday, M.A.K. (1994). *An Introduction to Functional Grammar.* (2nd Ed). London, Edward Arnold.

Hasan, R. (1985b). *Part B of language, context, and text: Aspects of language in a social semiotic perspective.* In M.A.K Halliday & R. Hasan (1985). Burwood, Melbourne: Deakin University.

Mumtaz, N., S. *The Struggle of Setting the Truth Free: A Literary Response to Agus Noor's "Kartu Pos dari Surga".* Students' Text Writing.

Williams, G. (1993). Using systemic grammar in teaching young learners. In L. Unsworth (1993). (Ed). *Literacy learning and teaching. Language as social practice in primary school*. Melbourne: Macmillan Education Australia Pty Ltd.