

# Reactions on the Translation of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* by Alexandre Dumas in Hikajat Siti Mariah by Hadji Moekti in Indonesian Literature in the Dutch Colonial Era

<sup>1</sup>Dwi SUSANTO, <sup>2</sup>Nur SAPTANINGSIH

<sup>1,2</sup> Universitas Sebelas Maret – Indonesia

Received : 26 February 2020 | Accepted : 31 December 2020

**RÉSUMÉ.** La traduction du Comte de Monte Cristo d'Alexandre Dumas dans la littérature indonésienne coloniale européenne (1900-1942) n'a pas été seulement appréciée par le transfert de langue, la traduction de texte ou l'adaptation. La traduction a reçu une réaction avec la création de nouvelles œuvres littéraires qui sont devenues des œuvres littéraires indonésiennes «authentiques», comme *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912). Divers problèmes répondaient à la construction textuelle du Comte de Monte Cristo. L'étude tente d'étudier la construction de l'identité représentée dans les deux textes à partir des paramètres narratifs, tels que l'espace, le genre, le corps et les relations raciales, dans une perspective postcoloniale. Les objets matériels sont *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* et *Hikajat iti Mariah*. L'objet formel est la réaction de la littérature indonésienne envers *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*. Les données de cette recherche sont le fond sociologique de ces œuvres littéraires, la nation coloniale dans ce texte et le discours colonial. L'interprétation des données se fait par lecture du modèle de déconstruction. Le résultat de cette recherche, la première, *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* renforce le romantisme et le matérialisme dans la construction de l'identité. La seconde, l'idée est rejetée par *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912) qui construit une identité basée sur le spiritisme comme force humaine.

**Mots-clés :** identité, *Hikajat Siti Mariah*, *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*, traduction.

**ABSTRACT.** The translation of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* by Alexandre Dumas in European colonial Indonesian literature (1900-1942) was not only appreciated through language transfer, text translation or adaptation. The translation received a reaction with the creation of new literary works that became "authentic" Indonesian literary works, such as *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912). Various issues were responding to the textual construction of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*. The study attempts to investigate the construction of the identity portrayed in the two texts from the narrative settings, such as space, gender, body, and race relations through a postcolonial perspective. The material object are *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* and *Hikajat iti Mariah*. The formal object is reaction Indonesia literature toward *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*. Data this research are sociological background this literary works, colonial nation in this text, and colonial discourse. The interpretation data is done by deconstruction model reading. The result this research, the first, *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* reinforces romanticism and materialism in the construction of identity. The second, the idea is rejected by *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912) which constructs identity based on spiritualism as human strength.

**Keywords:** identity, *Hikajat Siti Mariah*, *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*, translation.

✉ corresponding author : dwisastra81@gmail.com

**How to cite (APA Style) :** Susanto, D., & Saptaningsih, N. (2020). Reactions on the Translation of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* by Alexandre Dumas in *Hikajat Siti Mariah* by Hadji Moekti in Indonesian Literature in the Dutch Colonial Era. *Francisola: Revue Indonésienne de la langue et la littérature françaises*, 5(2), 61-72. doi: 10.17509/francisola.v5i2.32240.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The presence of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* (1844-1845), a well-known work by Alexandre Dumas, in Indonesian literature in the Dutch colonial era (1880-1942) was related to the policies of the colonial government in providing reading books for the colonies. This was a part of the efforts to civilize colonized society and the emergence of urban culture (Indies) in East Indies (Indonesia) (Chandra, 2011). *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*, in colonial Indonesian literature, experienced various translations and adaptations by several generations of Indonesian authors. This literary text appeared in various serial books. Authors made various sequels or parts of the story (Jedamski, 2002).

Adaptations were exemplified by several authors, among others, those written by Lie Kim Hok and F. Winggers entitled *Tjerita dari tangannja mait; samboengan Graff de Monte Cristo, karangan Alexander Dumas; Ditjeritakan dalam Bahasa Melajoe Rendah dengan menoeroet djalan jang gampang* (1899). Tjan Kiem Bie also appreciated this story by presenting a text entitled *Graff de Monte Cristo dengan estrinja atawa ketoeloesan achirnja menangkan segala kedjahatan* (1918). In addition to the two authors, PouwKioeAn (1931), Kwee Ten Hin (1933), and other authors presented their remarks on the work. Various moving theatrical performances or theaters also staged this story. This proves that the popularity and the presence of this story were indeed favored by the readers of Indonesian literature and at the same time related to colonial ideas in providing reading materials in the form of European translation literature.

Like the aforementioned, the presence of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* in the public of Indonesian literature in the colonial era was not separated from the Dutch's policy. The Dutch government, since 1850, put many alerts in providing education for Indonesian native people by giving

“appropriate” reading materials for their interests. This policy was directed especially to the feudal elites orientating at Western culture (Jedamski, 2002). Due to that policy, the Dutch government needed to provide the colonized community with Western or European classic literature. In the context of the postcolonial study, translation became a political and an ideological transformation to reconstruct the identity of the colonized community (Martins, 2017, p. 166-167). This strategy was the effort to penetrate the identity by exposing the community to the meeting of two traditions, Western tradition and Indonesian locality.

As a consequence, the meeting of texts with Western tradition and Indonesian locality (hybridity of locality and Islam) triggered the reaction from Indonesian literature. Indonesian public did not only admire the story or the narration but also provided counter ideas or counter texts for the texts, particularly to *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* by Alexander Dumas. The reaction became a political or ideological action from the readers to the presence of the work in Indonesian tradition. One of the texts indicating the reaction was *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912) by Hadji Moekti. Both *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* and *Hikajat Siti Mariah* have identical formulas or theme of the story. Thus, the meeting or the negotiation between West and East was seen in the reaction of the readers through new literary works in Indonesian literature.

They generally shared the content of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* which developed the idea of colonial bias and a desire for occupation or conquest, which was wrapped up in "civilization". Faruk revealed that *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* with other texts such as *Robinson Crusoe* or *Sherlock Holmes* indicated colonial bias and desire (Faruk, 2007, p.111). Jedamski also said that translations of Western literature in the colonial era in

Indonesia correlated to the politics of colonial policy regarding the construction of a pluralistic identity (Jedamski, 2002). The answer is how the public responded to Indonesian literature to *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*, especially in terms of the construction of identity through its narrative system, as in *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912).

Translation in the context of colonized society can be understood primarily as a part of imperialism practices. The selection and internalization of the values offered by Empire were parts of the efforts to "civilize" and "to introduce" the values of the Lord, as expressed by Eric Cheyfitz, that translation was the center of action of European colonization and imperialism in America (Cheyfitz, 1991, p. 104). Empire had begun rewriting and, astonishingly, creating the radical concept of translation as what had happened in India, Latin America, Canada, and in other places. European colonialism was stable and firm through the roles of language and translation (Bassnett & Trivedi, 1999, p.4).

The consumption of colonized people towards translation, as in the context of colonial Indonesian society, shows that translation as a colonial practice was carried out in an institutionalized manner and was reinforced not only by the authorities but also by the elites in the colonized society. People did not merely consume or enjoy translation works. They also internalized and, at the same time, created values, norms, cultural ideas, and ideology in the activities and various expressions in the work of translation. However, this fact did not necessarily mean all of this. Another factor was that the recreation created by colonized people provided various possibilities such as mimicry, ambiguity, and resistance to the construction offered by literary translation. Clifford revealed that the idea of culture is an equivalent of unchanging and coherent values

that emerge in action. The idea of culture in the context of literary recreation is a kind of symbol negotiation and symbol competition, which will all transform in various forms such as cultural codes of actions and various other expressions of the values, cultural ideas, and ideologies (Clifford, 1988).

*Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1908-1912, republish 1962-1965) by Hadji Moekti is one of recreation responding to the presence of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* through translation. In this context, the presence of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* through translation had inspired the manifestation of *Hikajat Siti Mariah*. *Hikajat Siti Mariah* was a remark to the writing of a literary text, which provided a negotiation or a way to deal with different cultural encounters and identities. Through narrative arrangements, for example, the two texts provided a textual construction, a building of ideas and an ideology that led to the concept of identity. From the two texts compared, what was seen as the voice of the colonized in reacting to the cultural construction of identity by the colonial for themselves, through the text of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* and the reaction of the colonized in *Hikajat Siti Mariah*. The resistance of the colonized people was not always in the form of rejection but could also be the involvement in the device that was dismantled and at the same time become the impact of representation from the contradictory colonial authority and did not always reverse power (Sharpe, 1995. p.145).

This question could be seen through the comparison of the two texts. *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* was translated and consumed by the Indonesian literary public about twenty years before the text of *Hikajat Siti Mariah* was presented. A similar phenomenon was also experienced by other Western literary texts such as *Robinson Crusoe* by Daniel Defoe, *J. Shepherd* by J.F. Oltmans and others. Those literary works were not only enjoyed by reading but also by providing ideas and

penetration in the image and thought of the colonized. This was as stated by Gayatri C. Spivak that epistemic colonization exemplified through English literature studies (Spivak, 2009). Ideological narrative construction spread in the narrative structure of the two texts. The narrative system of the two texts was the key to show identity construction. Through the construction of the two texts, the construction of the identity would be identified as part of the purposes of the translation and writing of the texts.

## 2. METHOD

This research use qualitative model, which focused data quality. The material object this research is *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* by Alexander Dumas ada Hikayat Siti Mariah by Hadji Mukti. The formal object this reseach is reaction Indonesia literature toward ideas *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*. The primary data in this research is content ann ideas which appear in this literary works. The research use secondary data, inculding sociological background of this text, colonial discourse, and genetical the reception text, and social background in Indonesia colonial era. The collection data use reading and recording. The techical interperatation data use deconstruction model reading in narrative literary text. The result of the reading text is related with secondary data. And then, the reading both primary data adn secondary data use poscolonial reading, especially identity and space concept.

## 3. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

### 3.1. *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* in Indonesian Literature in the Colonial Era

*Le Comte de Monte Cristo* is a story about a hero who commits his revenge. This story is originally a story about the bourgeois class in Europe who fight in maintaining power. Alexandre Dumas wrote this story in 1844-

1845. As a hired writer, he was invited to write in the style of the novel *Les mysetes de Paris* by Eygène Sue which received great success. This novel was present in the era of romanticism, formalism, and naturalism in French literature (Dracos, 1992). In its journey, this novel entered the world of the Dutch East Indies (the colonial era in Indonesia) through a translation conducted by Lie Kim Hok and F Wiggers in 1894-1899 in the form of a series of about twenty-five volumes or 2,300 pages. The first translation of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* received a positive response. The success was proven by the reproduction of the translation for many times. A republished edition in 1922 proved that 10,000 copies had been sold from each volume.

*Le Comte de Monte Cristo's* popularity in colonial Indonesian literature was encouraged by the policy that this text was mobilized as a reading book in colonial schools. Also, the growth of urban culture allowed the arrangement of entertaining reading materials for residents of the city or middle-class people in the Dutch East Indies (Indonesia). After the first translation was published, three years later, another translation was present, which was a reprint of the first translation. From 1922 to 1923, a new edition took form a serial book as an entertainment in the weekly magazine, *Penghiboer Hari Minggu*. The two translations had a narrative structure similar to the reality that of *Le Monte de Cristo*, the story of a hero who takes a payback. The story consists of two parts, namely the injustice faced by the character of the story and his success in taking an act of revenge (Jedamski, 2002).

According to Klotz (Klotz, 1979, p. 18-23), this novel did not only voice about the hero committing revenge due to the persecution of his reputation as a bourgeois class. The story develops as an adventure in restoring that reputation. The hero becomes a superhero and an invincible figure, an idea of

the victory of rationality and culture in controlling and directing what he has conquered. He tries to restore the position and desires to rule as the bourgeois class in his society. His intelligence and role as a superhero in overcoming all problems for the sake of his bourgeois class struggle signify a conquest and inferiority to other classes. In this context, there is a desire to control the stability of the social class for the exploitation of other groups. Furthermore, indeed, this novel does not present the whole character of the story as a bourgeois group in general.

The most important points in this novel are an adventure and a challenge to reach an idea and a conquest, namely capitalism. Thus, capitalism, the desire to conquer, human or superhero and the construction of the rationality identity become the spirit and the values offered by *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*. Based on that fact, this text indeed presents the construction of romanticism or materialism as the main part of its structure. This is evinced by the strength of the figure in regulating and controlling nature and the world around him. He can organize, create or use what he has for conquest. Modernity becomes a part of the narrative underlying this text construction. A strong belief in knowledge, science, and human capabilities has led to the nature of "racial and cultural superiority" because it has been able to create various tools and ideas for the advancement of their society (Russell, 2017, p.649-647).

The presence of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* in the Malay world received three kinds of responses. First, *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* was translated according to the source text. Second, the novel was translated and adapted to the Malay or Indonesian world up to Aceh, Indonesia, Western texts such as *Robinson Crusoe* turned the nuances into the tones of Islam (Abdullah, 2009: 224-225). Third, the work was adapted according to the image and perspective of the colonized or local

communities. Similar cases occurred in the translation of *Bintang Toedjoeh* (1886-1887) novel, which was adapted based on two European stories, namely *JlaLennep'sKlaasjeZevenster* (1802-1868) and *Les Tribulations d'un Chinois en Chine* by Jules Verne (1828 -1905)(Salmon, 1994, p. 125-156).

The presence of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* in modern Indonesian literature was not merely a matter of textual translation. Indonesian literature in the colonial era showed various canonization and aesthetic politics carried out by the Dutch colonial government. In the era of 1900 to 1942, the Dutch colonial government introduced various policies to strengthen its power over Indonesia. One pivotal thing implemented was carrying out the project of the birth of modern Indonesian literature, as part of the colonial heritage, called *Balai Pustaka* literature (the 1920s). As a result of Dutch colonial aesthetic politics, *Balai Pustaka* certainly created literature in line with the taste and desire of the colonizing community delivered to the colonized community. *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* translation was originally a colonial political effort to "introduce" and provide entertainment to the colonial community.

From the narrative point of view, the *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* story gives an idea of the narrator's voice as a person who knows everything. This shows that the narrator's voice is ambiguous, which sometimes appears everywhere and at the same time is silenced. Though unseen, the narrator appears like God, staying in humans' souls. As a consequence, the narrator can sometimes provide ironic and romantic comments and judgments about something in the story. Meanwhile, this text also provides a fairly panoramic description of the background or space in the text. This is obvious in the peculiarities and particularities of the various depicted spaces. Meanwhile, the narrator is



present in this particular and panoramic space, showing that the narrator is an adult and can control the space.

Concerning its contents, this novel presents the wealth and the prosperity of the bourgeoisie as a will of God. This is so for this novel puts the body lower than the soul and the spirit. God becomes a governing and controlling force so that humans only act as God's will. Finally, wealth serves as a means controlled by humans and God is the one who takes control of humans. In viewing gender issues, this novel has a favorable idea, seeing women as sensitive and delicate persons. Women can face difficulties and tragedies in their lives. They can live and survive in the world of their own experiences. Even though strong and steadfast, women are not as active as men. They only act as mothers or lovers who depend on men's power. Gender and patriarchy issues arise and dominate the narrative structure of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*.

Meanwhile, in a broader context, the narrative structure of this text shows that it emphasizes on European centric powers. The point expressed by this text is the opinion that applies only in the European context. Meanwhile, this text raises ideas that tend to place Easterners as creatures who merely have physiques. They are considered lacking spirit and enthusiasm because Easterners are valued merely for the bodies. Their spirits are considered to have no relationship and effect on their bodies. Such an idea exposes that this text is not only about the utterance of the hero's revenge and the bourgeois class struggle in defending power and capitalism, but it also proclaims the construction of a colonial identity about the control of the Eastern world, gender construction and Eastern human bodies, and particular spaces that are subdued in the East (Peck & Coyle, 1993, p. 137)

### **3.2. *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912) by Haji Moekti: Refusal on the Identity Construction in *Le Comte de Monte Cristo***

The *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912) was considered wild reading or marginal literature. This text was published in an indigenous newspaper, *Medan Prijaji*, an anti-colonial newspaper led by Tirta Adhi Soerja, a pioneer of the Indonesian press world. This text was published successively from 7 November 1910 to 6 January 1912 with the author Hadji Moekti, a Muslim whose true identity was unknown. This text has similarities in terms of narrative patterns with *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*. The similarities with the content of *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912) cover the theme or topic of the story, adventure narrative, bourgeois class life and efforts to unite the triumphs of middle-upper class families damaged by colonialism penetration through capital liberalism into colonial lands, namely sugar cane plantations. This text presents native, European and Indo-European figures (indigenous *mestizo* or hybrid and Dutch) who seek to establish socio-economic positions in colonial society. Also, this text presents the nuances of Islam as a unifying identity of the colonized people.

The narrative of the story begins with the origin of the main character, namely Siti Mariah, the illegitimate child of the "concubine" of Javanese aristocracy with the Dutch government official. Siti Mariah is sold by her stepfather, Wongsodrono, to Djojopranoto, an employee of a Dutch sugar factory. She is educated in European culture and lives in a Dutch environment. When she grows up, she becomes the mistress of Henri van Dam, an employee of the Dutch factory, because the couple love each other. However, after Siti Mariah gives birth to a child named Ary van Dam, Henry van Dam has to marry Lucie, the daughter of Henry's employer, Mrs. van Holstein, since interracial marriage is not permitted by the colonial government. Interracial marriage is seen as a weakening in a race or a degeneration of European morality. Henry and Lucie move to Europe and left Siti

Mariah and Ary van Dam. In the Netherlands, Lucie's life is portrayed as the character of Madame Bovary in a novel *Madame Bovary* by Gustave Flaubert. She lives lavishly and presents herself as a successful upper class in the colony. Henry van Dam's household life with Lucie is shattered. She's dead and buried lavishly in the atmosphere of her family's bankruptcy. Lucie is also known to be the illegitimate child of her mother's affair with a man.

The description and evaluation provided by the narrator in this text also show a bias, a concern for the voices of indigenous or colonized people. Europeans are voiced by the narrator as people who are unfriendly and unsympathetic to the natural environment, look down on the natives, are easily persuaded in evil conspiracies and do not like colonized people but try to possess them. They are equivocal in looking at the existing space. Phrases in the Islamic linguistic code also color up this story. Although Europeans in this text do not believe in religion, they do admire occult things, magic, and spirits to prophesy. Apart from that, the game of identity becomes the main motive in this text. The characters such as Siti Mariah, Soendari and Ary van Dam make changes in identity many times in dealing with different cultural environments and geographical spaces. The game of identity is a strategy to survive and to be accepted in a different space (Upstone, 2009).

*Le Comte de Monte Cristo* introduces the concept of the body and its relationship to wealth. Looking at Edmond Dantes' experience, when he found the wealth he inherited, he could gain position, influence, and power in society in the world. *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* makes use of wealth to help kind and unfortunate people. Furthermore, he uses wealth to commit revenge. He says that wealth is not merely a tool for human, it is the property entrusted by God. In such a context,

the view on the spirit and the body is derived from the view on wealth. This is proven by the view of Ali and Haydee who have a low position, representing the East. Such views become commonplace in colonial contests in European novels at the time. In viewing body, race, and power, *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* places the body in a lower position than the soul, mind, and spirit. God is a power that is everywhere and cannot be seen, and thus, he can determine all means through humans' minds.

The *Hikajat Siti Mariah* has something in common but has a different point of view in body, race, and God. In general, the two texts have the same narrative structure, an adventure marrying family honor and attempts to arise the upper middle class or noble class. If the text of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* prioritizes the idea of romanticism, the response, *Hikajat Siti Mariah*, rejects it. Human's effort becomes part of the way to survive. He returns to balance between humans and God. On the contrary, *Le Conte de Monte Cristo* is trying to control nature with human effort. The idea contained in *Hikajat Siti Mariah*, though presented with the same narrative structure, rejects the construction of an identity in which human strength and the body are the main force or culture ruling the nature. This idea is a romantic view which is put forward by *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* and rejected by *Hikajat Siti Mariah*.

The adventure of unity and the victory of the noble family of *Siti Mariah* are not the same as those of the social class that *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* has fought for through his revenge. Adventure in *Hikajat Siti Mariah* is a concept or way of getting around and surviving in various cultural encounters in the context of relations between races and between the colonizing and colonized classes. The unequal relationship is implied in identity hybridity and at the same time mimicry to mock the imitated (Ghasemi,

Sasani, & Nemat, 2018, p.35-36). The adventure is essentially an act of revenge for the defeat of the soul and the colonized soul. Meanwhile, *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* reinforces the view that the human spirit is unable to influence the body. In other words, materialism or capitalism will never be defeated by the human spirit but the human spirit is controlled by its material, namely its body.

In terms of spatial structure, *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* starts from Marseilles to If Island, Monte Cristo Island, Southern France, Rome, Paris and to the East. Space starts from the port of Marseilles, Canbierre, Rue de Noilles, Alles de Meihan Street, to La Reserve shop, the palace of King Louis XVIII, and the sea. However, this is not significant. In general, the space of this text stretches from the Western Hemisphere to the Eastern World. Space moves from wealth or very luxurious homes and cultural centers to secluded places from a fisherman or from the king's palace to the place of criminals. The various spaces cover particular spaces or diverse experiences. The world of experience and history characterize the European novels of that era (Zacharias, 2015, p.209-210). However, they present a figure of the East as a strange and distant space that is mysterious or poor. The East is limited to a passion for sexuality about wild and beautiful women and mysterious nature such as the talents of a slave, the pleasure of killing people, or cooking utensils which are vaguely described. This depiction is a picture that was common in the post-colonial context in European novels at that time (Anjaria, 2012).

Repetition of experience over space destroys the particularity of experiences in *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*. Besides, this also helps lessen the uniqueness and historicity of the presented space. Space has a conception of history, thought and various experiences that are present in it (Krishnan, 2017, p.630). This

is similar to *Sinbad Si Petualang* novel which presents Arabic cuisine or duplication of the East. *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* indeed illustrates the spaces that apply in the European world. East is the veiled Haydee and mute Ali. The two of them can only be captured from their clothes and physical appearances. These facts also strengthen the idea of the Western view towards the East, in which the East is considered the Outsider, mysterious or feminine (Mills, 1993).

This view is different from the view presented in the *Hikajat Siti Mariah*. Space moves from the periphery of the imperial or colonized towards the Imperial power of colonialism in the Dutch colonial sugar factory. Then, space moves to the edges and becomes scattered. Meanwhile, the geographical space of the center of colonial moves to absolute power, namely Europe. The invaders in their motherland, Europe, are not recognized and do not find happiness. Because, space in Europe is the space for a bourgeois group filled with boring "styles", without any spiritual values, so that people do not find the happiness of life until their death. Then, the character, Henry Van Dam returns to the land of Java, Indonesia, to find happiness. The colonized voice also migrates, to the Arab world, the holy lands of Mecca and Medina.

The idea put up on space in the *Hikajat Siti Mariah* is that happiness in the scattered and colonized land and the unity of the soul emerges in that land, Islam as a power that unites marginalized spaces. However, Islam is not considered the puritanism of the teachings existing in Arab countries, but Islam adapts to the locality of Javanese cultural tradition. Empire of the European Center for Civilization or Culture does not appeal to reach by the colonized people, like Soendari and Siti Mariah or other figures such as Djopranoto or Henry Van Dam. In this context, Henry van Dam internalizes the



values of being colonized and thus he leaves his European identity. This is a deconstruction of the notion of grandeur, cultural center and the perfect symbol of life introduced by the Empire as in *the text Le Comte de Monte Cristo*. Spirituality in the context of Javanese and Islamic traditions defeats materialism brought by the text of *Le Comte Monte de Cristo*. In the context of space, *Hikajat Siti Mariah* text essentially deconstructs the concept of space offered by *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*. The deconstruction process can be seen in the reversal of the superiority of mind or material which shifts into the predominance of spirituality and the will of nature by tragically killing a European figure and returning European racial figure into a figure with Eastern spirituality which brings happiness and perfection of life.

In the concept of the body, race, and gender, both texts have the same characteristics in describing the body, displaying the body with a detailed mental picture. Mental changes also happen through the changes of the body, such as Edmond Dantes's body which changes due to imprisonment and Henry Van Dam's body which changes due to imprisonment in Europe by his wife, Lucie. However, the meaning of the body contained in both texts are different. The text of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* further emphasizes the physical or physical nature of the characters. Meanwhile, *Hikajat Siti Mariah* displays more psychological traits and signs rather than bodily ones. The physical nature of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* is more favored so that the body becomes highly cherished as the suicide of Morcef whose crime is exposed, so that his wife and children, Morrel and Maxmile, also commit suicide.

By using the devices, *Hikajat Siti Mariah* emphasizes the spiritual or divine nature. God is in such a prime position that injuring the body or committing suicide is not

permitted and does not even appear in the characters' minds. Lucie's death is a punishment from God due to a disease because of her sexual relationships with several men in Europe. This indicates that God's punishment is stronger than the formal law of society or social law. Meanwhile, *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* prioritizes social law, the nation, and physical punishment. This also specifies that the spirit is not important to *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*—human material is in the body along with the mentality. This idea also confirms that the text of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* has the idea of romanticism rejected by *Hikajat Siti Mariah*.

In exploring women's issues, *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* presents an idea that is much different from that of *Hikajat Siti Mariah*. Haydee, for example, is seen as different from Mercedes or Valentine. Women like Valentine, Mercedes, and others are those who have a spirit and body which is also influenced by spiritual development. Evil women like Mrs. Danglars and Mrs. Morcef are also sensitive and easily hurt. The women appearing in *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* are pretty much like Mrs. Saint-Meran, Mercedes, Mrs. Villefort, Haydee, and others. Haydee herself is the daughter of Ali Paska, a former king, who becomes a slave and the second lover of Monte Cristo. All these women are housewives or prospective housewives who have a material life, relying on men or family inheritance. Women are categorized based on their characters, including greedy and cruel women, lovable and caring women, and patient and kind women. Eugenie is an independent woman, while Mrs. Danglars is a woman who is interested in the world of trading and stocks but she has an affair with a man.

Meanwhile, women in *the Hikajat Siti Mariah* are classified into several groups, namely indigenous women, hybrid or Indo-Javanese women (Javanese and European),

and European women. Indigenous and Indo-European women have almost the same characteristics. They, such as Siti Mariah, Mrs. Wongsodrono and Sarinem, are described as women who have a noble, independent and strong heart to endure hurt, who are fighters, and who protect the values of truth, loyalty, and the image of women who are economically and psychologically capable. Meanwhile, European women such as Lucie, Mrs. Van Hoslstien, Mrs. Dolares, and others are described as women who are ambitious for luxury, foul and greedy and disloyal to the family, as well as tend to exploit others and have evil but fragile heart. This contradictory depiction is a deconstruction of the great image of Europe or the source of civilization and culture. In selecting a family, for example, European women tend to destroy their own families for their desires. In the context of the economy, indigenous or Indo-European women have a better ability in supporting their families and themselves or do not rely on family wealth and inheritance and their husband's incomes.

These facts show that Eastern women depicted in *the Hikayat Siti Mariah* are post-feminist women. They are psychologically, faithfully and economically capable and independent. The facts also identify the rejection of the idea that Eastern women are only seen as women who are retarded, stupid and lusty. Through this construction of Eastern women, this text essentially rejects the efforts of women emancipation in the Western world because the social, cultural, and historical contexts between European women and Eastern women are different so that the coercion or penetration of the construction of European women's identities into the Eastern cannot be fully accepted because the experience of being colonized is different. The post-colonial feminist idea has explained to recognize the phenomena. Different conditions of being colonialized, different

experiences, different social environments and cultures will form different characters that cannot be compared one to another. This fact is similar to the Islamic values brought by the characters in this text, which is different from the image of Islam in its home country, the Middle East, namely Islam which is united with locality values and accommodates the Western world such as Soendari and Djopranoto or Kyai Bintaran. The figures are essentially not anti with Western culture, but accommodate the difference as a means to achieve a unity of identity that is flexible, namely Islam, locality, and the West within it.

Based on the above identification, the description of the relationship between race constructed by considering gender and the body of women shows that as a text that voices colonized ideas, *Hikajat Siti Mariah* demonstrates that indigenous women have more power over their bodies and minds. On the contrary, in *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* European women depend on the power of men. Meanwhile, in looking at the female, *Hikajat Siti Mariah* prioritizes equality and power over indigenous women while European women as the sources of morality and culture are not worthy as models because they commit evil deeds and affair, and destroy their own families for the sake of passion and satisfaction for their body.

#### 4. CONCLUSION

The comparison of the two texts has shown an important aspect of observing the construction of identity between the colonized and the colonizer. Although *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* is enjoyed and translated in various versions, the reaction to the text is different. Indonesians like the ideas and the narrative arrangements of European stories such as *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*, but they reject the cultural and ideological constructions that emerge in the texts they admire and read. *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912) by Hadji Moekti provides an example of

an effort to deconstruct a superhuman image, materialism or rationality, and romanticism ideas introduced by *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* as parts of the European modernization projects. It seems that the presence of the translation of *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*, with all the constructs of identities or ideas that accompany the narrative construction, is responded through the narrative mimicry and the formula of the story by the Indonesian literary public. However, it contains the potential for resistance and rejection of the construction of the text it carries.

From the comparison of the narrative construction, the concept of race, gender relation, space and body, the opinions of the colonized and colonizing people are confronted and put in opposition. As a representative of colonized society, *Hikajat Siti Mariah* (1910-1912) essentially fight against the opinion through mimicry strategies on physical narrative patterns in the world of eternity. Mysterious voices in *Hikajat Siti Mariah*, as voices of hybrid identity, basically show that colonized people in the face of cultural encounters. They attempt cultural negotiation in the face of the offered ideas. *Siti Mariah Hikajat* is not anti-Western, but it accommodates Western ideas into a flexible. This is different from *Le Comte de Monte Cristo*, which constructs a Western identity versus Eastern identity in binary opposition and both of them cannot reconcile or unite in cultural encounters. In other words, the identity in *Hikajat Siti Mariah* is flexible while in *Le Comte de Monte Cristo* is solid and essential.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors wish to acknowledge those who made a significant contribution to the realization and to the improvement of this paper.

#### REFERENCES

Anjaria, U. (2012). *Realism in the twentieth century Indian novel; colonial difference and literary form*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Bassnett, S., & Trivedi, H. (1999). Introduction of colonies, cannibals and vernaculars. In S. Bassnett & T. Hariss (Eds.), *Post-Colonial Translation; Theory and Practice* (Routledge). New York and London.
- Chandra, E. (2011). Fantasizing Chinese/Indonesian Hero: Njoo Cheong Seng and the Gagaklodra Series. *Archipel*, 82, 83–113. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.3406/arch.2011.4256>
- Cheyfitz, E. (1991). *The poetics of imperialism: Translation and colonization from the Tempest to Tarzan*. New York and Oxford: : Oxford University Press.
- Clifford, J. (1988). *The Predicament of culture*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.
- Dracos, X. (1992). *Histoire de la littérature française*. Paris: Librairie Ha-chette. Paris: Librairie Ha-chette.
- Faruk. (2007). *Belenggu Pasca-Kolonial, Hegemoni dan Resistensi dalam Sastra Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Ghasemi, P., Sasani, S., & Nemat, F. (2018). Thirdspace, Hybridity, and Colonial Mimicry in Fugard's Blood Knot. *Khazar Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 21(1), 34–52. <https://doi.org/10.5782/2223-2621.2018.21.1.34>
- Jedamski, D. (2002). Popular literature and postcolonial subjectivities Robinson Crusoe, the Count of Monte Cristo and Sherlock Holmes in colonial Indonesia. In K. Foulcher & T. Day (Eds.), *Clearing a space , Postcolonial reading of modern Indonesian literature* (pp. 19–47). Leiden: KITLV Press.
- Klotz, V. (1979). *Abenteuer-Romane; Sue, Dumas, Ferry, Ratcliffe, May, Verne*. München/Wien: Hanser.
- Krishnan, M. (2017). Introduction: Postcolonial space across forms. *Journal of Postcolonial Writing*, 53(6). <https://doi.org/10.1080/17449855.2017.1403069>
- Martins, M. P. (2017). Reflections the postcolonial novel: an interdisciplinary approach.

- International Journal of Humanities and Culture Studies*, 4(2), 166–177.
- Mills, S. (1993). Gender and Colonial Space. *Gender, Place, and Culture*, 3(2), 125–148. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09663699650021855>
- Peck, J., & Coyle, M. (1993). *Literary Terms and Criticism*. London: Macmillan.
- Russell, B. (2017). *Sejarah filsafat Barat: kaitannya dengan kondisi sosio-politik zaman kuno hingga sekarang* (translated; S. Jatmika, ed.). Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Salmon, C. (1994). Aux origines du roman malais moderne: Tjhit Liap Seng ou les Pleiades de L.K.H. *Archipel*, 48, 125–156.
- Sharpe, J. (1995). Figure of colonial resistance. In B. Ashcroft (Ed.), *In The Post-Colonial Studies Reader* (Routledge). London and New York.
- Spivak, G. C. (2009). *Outside in the teaching machine*. New York and London: Routledge.
- Upstone, S. (2009). *Spatial Politics in the Postcolonial Novel*. England: Ashgate Publishing Company.
- Zacharias, R. (2015). Space and the Postcolonial novel. In A. Quayson (Ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to the Postcolonial Novel* (pp. 208–229). <https://doi.org/10.1017/CB097813164.59287.013>