

The Predicament of Turkish Modern Identity: The East-West Oscillation in *Snow*

Catharina Brameswari and Tatang Iskarna
Universitas Sanata Dharma

Corresponding authors. catharinabrameswari@usd.ac.id; iskarna@usd.ac.id

How to cite this article (in APA Style). Brameswari, C., & Iskarna, T. (2021). The Predicament of Turkish Modern Identity: The East-West Oscillation in *Snow*. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa dan Sastra*, 21(2), 187-196. DOI: https://doi.org/10.17509/bs_jpbsp.v21i2.44629

History of article. Received: March 2021; revised: July 2021; published: October 2021

Abstract. This research uses Orhan Pamuk's *Snow* in order to reveal the tension and oscillation between the East and the West which is represented by Ataturk's forced modernization on the restriction of veils in schools and public places. Pamuk uses Kars, a small city in Turkey's border which always covered by snow, to describe this tension. The women are presented as the oppressed who silently end their life as their way to protect their beliefs and tradition as well as the weapon to fight against the oppressor. To dismantle Pamuk's work that highlights the endless oscillation, I employ the method of library research by presenting the internal struggle experienced by the main characters that are forced to embrace Western tradition. This research deals with two issues namely oscillation and complex desire to imitate the Others experienced by the main characters the as well as the solutions to the predicament that are offered by Pamuk in *Snow*. This research is also accompanied by Said's Orientalism and Bhabha's Postcolonialism that are employed to illuminate the solutions. Additionally, the information on Turkey's history and socio-politic condition are presented. This research is a way to show how the oscillation can be solved by embracing one culture without leaving the other. Additionally, it is also a tool to raise the readers' awareness towards the problem on the predicament of the East and West and develop their critical thinking towards the forced modernity by the oppressor.

Keywords: oscillation; westernization; predicament

Kesulitan Identitas Modern Turki: Osilasi Timur-Barat dalam Novel *Snow*

Abstrak. Penelitian ini menggunakan Orhan Pamuk's *Snow* untuk mengungkap ketegangan dan gejala antara Timur dan Barat yang diwakili oleh modernisasi paksa Ataturk tentang pembatasan cadar di sekolah dan tempat umum. Pamuk menggunakan Kars, sebuah kota kecil di perbatasan Turki yang selalu diselimuti salju, untuk menggambarkan ketegangan ini. Para perempuan dihadirkan sebagai kaum tertindas yang secara diam-diam mengakhiri hidup mereka sebagai cara mereka untuk melindungi kepercayaan dan tradisi mereka serta senjata untuk melawan para penindas. Untuk membongkar karya Pamuk yang menonjolkan osilasi tak berujung, saya menggunakan metode studi pustaka dengan menghadirkan pergulatan internal yang dialami para tokoh utama yang dipaksa menganut tradisi Barat. Penelitian ini membahas dua masalah yaitu osilasi dan keinginan kompleks untuk meniru Orang Lain yang dialami oleh karakter utama serta solusi untuk kesulitan yang ditawarkan oleh Pamuk di Salju. Penelitian ini juga disertai dengan Orientalisme Said dan Postkolonialisme Bhabha yang digunakan untuk menerangi solusi. Selain itu, disajikan pula informasi tentang sejarah dan kondisi sosial politik Turki. Penelitian ini merupakan cara untuk menunjukkan bagaimana osilasi dapat diselesaikan dengan merangkul satu budaya tanpa meninggalkan yang lain. Selain itu, juga sebagai alat untuk meningkatkan kesadaran pembaca terhadap masalah kesulitan Timur dan Barat dan mengembangkan pemikiran kritis mereka terhadap modernitas yang dipaksakan oleh penindas.

Kata kunci: osilasi; westernisasi; kesulitan

Introduction

Kemal Atatürk has abruptly changed the Islamic Ottoman tradition into more modern system to become part of European Union. After the fall of the Empire, he tries to use Europe and his westernization project as a remedy for Turkey's poor condition. Europe is Turkey's highest hope to bring back its glory. It is mentioned by Said (2003) that the Orient, which is represented by the Ottoman Islamic tradition, is always related to backwardness, inferiority, and poverty. Due to that condition, the new Turkey's president radically changed those stereotypes into all opposed values owned by the Orient. Eder (2001) mentions that "a separation of state and religion, such as the restriction of veils in the parliament and school", has done in order to be more European. In addition, Kemal Atatürk also had the Turks to adopt Latin alphabet and left the Arabic script (Pamuk, 2008, p. 192).

This abrupt condition has led to the predicament and issues on the search of an ideal identity. The sudden changes happened in Turkey were outstandingly captured by Orhan Pamuk in his novels. Pamuk's works mostly focus on the question of searching for the ideal identity and the encounter between the East and the West, which are not the contemporary issue since the Ottoman Empire. This encounter leads to the dilemma of the Ottoman Turks who are searching for their identity in the influence of Western values. Pamuk captures this problem into his works through the tragedy which is used as a trigger to criticise the elites. Pamuk's works also discuss the issues related to the self-modernization project and the questions of searching for the new identity. This is then "dramatized" in the new symbol of the clash between the secularist and traditionalist in *Snow*.

Snow is Pamuk's political novel that describes how women's life and headscarves have been politically used to gain political power. This novel is situated in Kars, a marginalized border city which is geographically located in the North-Eastern Turkey. In this city, Ka, who belongs to a

Westernized secular family, come back to his hometown after twelve years of exile in Germany. Kars witnesses many women who silently end their life to protect their beliefs, tradition, and dignity. *Snow* is a tool used by Pamuk to complicate the rise of the Islamic movement under the AKP, which puts Turkey's people in confusion and *büzün* after embracing modernity under the reign of Kemal Atatürk. Moreover, it is also presented to tell the readers that living with only one single soul may lead us to the irony.

Based on the issues mentioned above, this research is conducted to (1) reveal the oscillation, tension, and complex desire to imitate the Other and (2) find the solutions towards the problems that are experienced by the oppressed character in Pamuk's *Snow*. This novel is selected because this problem is very close to our life especially the problem on the forced modernization which can also happen in Indonesia. In addition, this issue is important to be discussed since appreciating, respecting, and maintaining the diversity of cultures, traditions, and religions around us are essential. Furthermore, *Snow* has all aspects which can sharpen the readers' awareness on the enchantment of modernity that challenge the multiculturalism or even disrupt their culture and traditions as well as lead to the identity crisis. Lastly, in practical, this study can be used by the *Contemporary Literary Criticism, Prose, and Thesis Writing* students to sharpen and train their critical thinking in analysing literary works from Orientalism perspective.

Literature Review

This part is divided into two sections. The first section presents the previous studies from three researchers which also investigate *Snow*. The second section, illustrates Said's discourse on Orientalism and Bhabha's discourse on Postcolonialism. Moreover, this section also demonstrates how the theories function in unveiling the solution to the formulated questions.

Review of Related Studies

Orhan Pamuk, the winner of the Nobel Prize in Literature in 2006, tries to reintroduce the grandeur of the Ottoman past and the tension of the East-West, traditional-modern, and Islamist-Secularist. He wants to frame Atatürk political agenda to modernize Turkey through his tale about tragedies which happened in Kars. As a result, this work invites scholarly discussions especially on the dialogue, tension, and negotiation between the Easterner and the Westerner. Moreover, it also attracts a discussion on the identity formation process toward the so-called a new ideal identity. There are groups of researchers who conducted their studies by using *Snow* as the main object of study. Those scholars' different perspectives in analysing *Snow* are essential to be discussed because those are the stepping stones in conducting this research.

The first research to mention is by Muh. Fajar (2013) entitled "Secularism in Pamuk's *Snow*: A Postcolonialism Study". It focuses on the problems of Secularism which appear in the novel. He explains how the characters in the novel are influenced by Western value while other characters are still maintaining their tradition. Another discussion is raised by Kholisah, Huda, and Setyorini (2017) in "Moslem Women Resistance against Secularist's Domination in Orhan Pamuk's *Snow* Novel" and by Makandar (2017) in "Orhan Pamuk's *Snow*: A Symbol of Feminist Struggle". Both papers problematized the banning headscarf and the manifestation of the Moslem women's movement and resistance to fight for the oppressor. The third research is from Ülker Gökberk (2008) who explores the multifaceted discourse on Islam in present-day Turkish society.

Even though this novel tells about the problem on the banning of the headscarves and the feminist movement to protect their right, Pamuk only uses these problems as triggers to dive deeper to the real problems faced by Turkey. From three researches above, none of them discussed

the predicament of the East and West and the problem on the identity formation processes. As a result, this paper tries to find the niche that is still possible to be explored. The problems on the forced modernization and the journey in finding Turkey's ideal identity are put under the microscope in this research. Apart from the researches mentioned above, this research will employ Said's and Bhabha's discourse on Orientalism and Postcolonialism, which focus on mimicry, ambivalence, hybridity, and in-betweenness. Additionally, this research will discuss more the problem on the duality of the binary opposition of the East and the West and an irony which are experience by both the Easterners and the Westerners.

Review of Theoretical Concept

The encounter between the East and the West has been dramatized and presented as a new symbol of clash and mix of culture. Many ideas and theories have been offered to illuminate this classic problem. Furthermore, many dialogues are conducted to analyse the East-West predicament which is the main issue in *Snow*. Despite the fact that this novel invites various theories, this research only focus on Said's Orientalism and Bhabha's Postcolonialism theory. This section deals with the theory on Orientalism and the discourse on Postcolonialism which are used to illuminate the problems. Those are employed to deconstruct the complex predicament of tradition and modernity and the complex desire to imitate the Other. This is for the reason that it is not the Europeans who look down on Turkish people. In fact, it is Turkish people who are self-orientalised themselves (Pamuk, 2005, p. 73).

Edward Said (2003) explains that Orientalism is a style of thought based on the ontological and epistemological distinction between "The Orient" and "The Occident" (p. 2). He underlines Orientalism as a product of Europe's—mainly British and French—certain political forces and activity (p. 203) as well as domination and

hegemony over the East. In line with Said, the relationship between Occident and Orient is a relationship of power where the Orient is always stereotyped as the weak. Said (2003) stresses that,

the other feature of the Orient was that Europe was always in a position of strength. There is no way of putting this euphemistically...the essential relationship, on political, cultural, and even religious grounds was seen to be one between a strong and weak partner (p.40).

From the quotation above, Said (2003) describes the Orient as Europe's cultural contestant and one of its deepest and most recurring images of the Other. He argues that the Orient has helped to define Europe (or the West) as its contrasting image, idea, personality, and experience (pp. 1-2). Thus, the concept of binary opposition is important for the West to "dominate and maintain the power over the Orient" (Loomba, 2005, p. 3) and elongate the East-West dichotomy; if the Orient is weak, Europe is strong; if the Orient is inferior then the Occident is superior; if the Orient is static, Europe can be seen as developing and marching ahead (p. 45).

Due to the predicament between the traditionalist and secularist in *Snow*, Said's Orientalism and Bhabha's Postcolonialism are used to highlight it. Additionally, those discourses are employed to dismantle the solutions towards the oscillation which leads to hybridity, in-betweenness, mimicry, and ambivalence. Orientalism is closely related to Postcolonialism since the analysis of the binary opposition and the relationship between Self and Other, East and West are at the core of Postcolonialism. The case of Turkey is very special. Since the Ottoman Empire, Turkey has a great power which can be seen from the capitulation of Byzantine Empire to Mehmed II. Akalin (2007) also mentions that the West respects the Ottoman Empire for their military power and it was even Europe's great rival for

commercial hegemony in economic space (p. 122).

As Turkey's deepest image of the Other, Europe is very important for Pamuk's works for he always presents and complicates this binary opposition in them, especially in *Snow*. For that reason, I use the discourse on Orientalism to analyse the self-orientalism as well as the binary opposition and the complex desire to imitate others that is experience by Pamuk's characters in his oeuvre. Turkey, led by the elite, colonises its mind to radically change their Islamic culture as a way to westernize itself. It is along with Nandy (1983) who mentions that this colonialism colonises minds in addition to bodies and it releases forces within colonised societies to alter their cultural priorities once and for all. This self-colonization is the result of the abrupt westernization which is "associated with an elite movement, to rapidly "civilize" society borrowed from the Soviet example and Europe" (Göknaar, 2006) through imitating their values of modernity. The desire to westernize Turkey had created the commitment and ambition to the conquest of Turks own mind, selves, and culture. In additional, to have Turkey civilized and modernized, they erased their history and left the Ottoman tradition.

This oscillation has encouraged the Turks to find some ways in overcoming their sorrow and confusion. Bhabha (1994) explains that mimicry emerges as one of the most elusive and effective strategies of colonial power and knowledge (p.85). He adds that the discourse of mimicry is constructed around "ambivalence" because it stays on the two different conditions. In order to be effective, mimicry must continually produce its slippage, its excess, its difference. The imitation towards the colonizer does not mean that the colonized imitates the colonizer identically. Bhabha adapts Weber's formulation that colonial mimicry is the desire for a reformed, recognisable Other, as a subject of difference that is "almost the same, but not quite". Bhabha (1994) says that mimicry is a

sign of a double articulation, which “appropriates” the Other as it visualises power (p. 85). Furthermore, mimicry is a double articulation because it exists on both sides; the colonizer and the colonized, or the Self and the Other (Lou, 2011).

Hybridity is an anti-colonial weapon used by the Turks. In most of his works, Pamuk suggests a new identity which is the combination of East and West to overcome Turkey’s predicament. He insists that identity may be hybrid, the combination of two, or totally a new identity which is discovered during the identity formation processes. Bhabha (1994) writes that the desire to emerge as “authentic” through mimicry—through a process of writing and repetition—is the final irony of partial representation (p. 88). He states that mimicry is the effect of hybridity. Through imitating the colonizer, the colonized tries to rewrite his identity in the liminal space by becoming hybrid (p. 120). Huddart (2006) adds that identities operate as palimpsests. He argues that identities are overwritten on which earlier writing is still visible underneath newer writing (p. 107). This is in line with Turkey’s condition that their new identity is written above their Islamic Ottoman identity. That identity is still visible even though it had been erased through the Westernization project conducted by Atatürk.

Method

In this study, I mainly employed the method of library research. There are two sources used, namely primary and secondary sources. The method applied in conducting the study is qualitative approach with the primary source is Orhan Pamuk’s oeuvre entitled *Snow* (2005). To support the primary datum, the secondary data are taken from books, Pamuk’s non-fictions *Istanbul: Memories of the City* (2006) and *Other Colours* (2008), journals, articles, criticism, interview, book review, and video which analyse and discuss Orhan Pamuk and his literary work. The data then analysed to discover the connection between the socio-culture and

political condition as well as events portrayed in the novel. The research will be conducted in several steps. After finding the topic and *Snow* as the primary data, the first step is the technical reading of the novels as the fundamental step before turning to further analysis. The second step is formulating the problems related to the topic. The next step is finding the secondary sources and the appropriate approach to be employed in this research. This research adopts Said’s Orientalism and Bhabha’s Postcolonialism on mimicry, ambivalence, and hybridity. Next, after applying the theories to answer the formulated questions, all findings are analysed as the result in discussion section. Then, they are summed up and concluded in the last part of this manuscript. Additionally, some suggestions to the future researchers are also presented in this part.

Results and Discussion

In this part, the answers of the formulated questions are put under the microscope. This part is divided into two sections, namely: (1) the Oscillation, tension, and complex desire to imitate the Other and (2) the solution to the predicament and the East-West oscillation. The first section illustrates how the characters in the novel deal with the tension and the feeling of melancholy as the result of the complex desire to embrace Western culture. In the second section, I try to depict the solution to overcome the feeling of melancholy and the predicament experienced by the main characters in *Snow*.

The Oscillation, Tension, and Complex Desire to Imitate the Other

Turkey is also a special country which has a unique location. It lies on two continents—Western Asia and South Eastern Europe—and invited people from various tribes and nations. Serdar Bey, the owner of *Border City Gazette*, also mentions that during the Ottoman era all people from various ethnics and tribes were brothers. The Turkmens, the Posof Laz, the

Germans—who had been exiled here by the czar—never took any pride in proclaiming themselves different (*Snow*, pp. 25-26). From this novel, we can find the information on Turkey's cosmopolitanism which had flourished since the Ottoman Empire. Jardine and Brotton (2000) mention that the encounter between various cultures, which had been flourished in the 15th century, was motivated by the commercial background (p. 32). Moreover, traders from many places sailed across Asia from Europe when the Constantinople was still exist (Boyar & Fleet, 2010, p. 15) and the cultural exchange could not be avoided.

Actually, Turkey has never been colonized by Western power. In fact, it is the Ottoman that conquered the Constantinople and pushed its soldiers up to the Northern Europe. The cosmopolitanism has grown their wish to conquer, to embrace, or even to resemble the West. It is for the reason that the Other always appears as something more important and enchanting. On the other hand, the loss of the Ottoman Empire in the World War II and the transitional period under Atatürk had left Turkey a deep wound. Atatürk used his Westernization project as if it was the remedy for Turkey's poor condition in the beginning of the Republic era. Europe has always figured as a dream, a vision of the future, a goal to achieve or danger, and a future—an imagined future (Pamuk, 2008, p. 190). Turkey wanted to westernize itself but was held by the hundreds years of Islamic traditions that had been rooted. They felt that Islam and the Ottoman tradition were their biggest obstacles in order to be the West and modern. It is in line with Pamuk who mentions that “Europe will not be a memory just like the collapsed Ottoman Empire” (p. 190).

Turkey always wants to move closer to the West, be more like Europeans—civilized and modern (*Snow*, p. 96)—and try to join the European Union. Nevertheless, its effort is still rejected by the West. The authoritarian leader's agenda to purify Turkey is an irony since various religions,

cultures, and races had been flourishing during the Ottoman Empire. The cosmopolitanism had vanished since Westernization revolution and at the beginning of the rise of the Islamic movement. The real tension here is between the East and the West. Due to this condition, Orhan Pamuk tries to show the predicament by illustrating the conflict between the Secular State and the Islamic Government. The onset of this conflict was at the end of the Ottoman Empire and during the transition era. It took place when the Kemalist forcedly installed Western cultures and when the Islamic party takes control the government to bring the glory of Islamic traditions back in Turkey.

In the beginning of the Republic, Turkish people live in poverty, unemployment, predicament, and melancholy. Moreover, both the Secularists and the Fundamentalists, they want Turkey to have only one national identity either becomes totally the East or totally the West. These conditions have dragged the Turks into the deepest feeling of melancholy, *büzün*. Mostly, *Snow* recites the abrupt changes during the transition era from the Islamic Ottoman into the modern Western country. Nevertheless, we can also find how Orhan Pamuk tries to criticise the Islamic group which at that time tries to bring back the glory of the Islamic Ottoman Empire through controlling the government. This situation, which is also dramatically told in *Snow*, has put Turkish people in the predicament and melancholy for they have to leave the Islamic tradition and embrace the secular tradition.

Set in Kars, the border city in the Eastern Anatolia, the Islamic fundamentalists are encouraging young women to wear headscarves while the secular state forces them to uncover their heads. The oscillation of this “miserable political intrigue” (*Snow*, p. 32) is dramatically symbolized by Kars which is always described as awful with its never ending snow. This falling snow may evoke such a deep feeling of the loss of the past

glory. Pamuk illustrates this remote city as a dark, gloomy, and despairing look city which represents the feelings of the people who live there. The Islamic government, which has communal religious agendas, uses Kars citizens who feel ignored and forgotten by the state to fight against the secular system. They also have politicized head scarf and the young women in Kars to gain power. This brings “a great suffer to the womenfolk for they turn head scarves into symbols and using women as pawns in a political game” (Pamuk, *Snow*, p. 43).

In addition, the radical Islamic group also make threats against the secular country and murder the secularists to protect Koran and Islam. On the contrary, the secular authoritarian leader insists that Turkey must become part of European Union for it is the only solution to save Turkey from backwardness and poverty. It is for the reason that European Enlightenment is more important than the women, the subaltern, and head scarf is associated with the lower class families.

In the westernized-upper-middle-class circles of the young Ka's Istanbul, a covered woman would have been someone who had come in from the suburbs—from the Kartal vineyards, to sell grapes. Or she might be the milk man's wife or someone else from the lower classes. (Pamuk, *Snow*, p. 22)

Here, veil and covered women have been the indication for backwardness, poverty, and they are believed that they may bring Turkey into failure. Conversely, women always live under pressure of the authorities and although Pamuk rarely uses women to illustrate the problem in Turkey, here in *Snow* he makes a kind of breakthrough. In *Snow*, the interesting fact about them is that they kept unbearable pressures from their father, husband, society, and both the government and the fundamentalist group. What is interesting about their suicide is that they commit the suicide abruptly in the midst of their everyday routine without any sign or warning. This action then is like an

epidemic which spreads and inspires the other young women.

The Solution to the Predicament and the East-West Oscillation

It is not a secret that Orhan Pamuk is rejected by both Turkish political sides—the Secularists and Religious Conservatives—for he refuses to choose one position and identity. In his novels, Pamuk illustrates the tragic live of the Secularists and Conservatives because they insists to only embrace one identity. Through this plot, he wants to show to his reader that having one single identity is not the solution to Turkey's endless oscillation. Pamuk (2008) encourages his readers to let this process become natural for “if they are worry too much about one part which can kill the other part, you will be left with a single spirit” (p. 370). Additionally, I argue that the forced modernization and the way to bring back the glory of Islamic tradition back to Turkey will only bring the people in confusion and melancholy.

The identity that is forced by the authoritarian leader—both the secularists and fundamentalists—has brought a deep sorrow towards many people who live in Turkey, especially in Kars. In addition, I argue that living with one culture will defeat the other and will leave the people in confusion, predicament, and melancholy. As we can see, Ka lives quite miserably in Germany because he feels rejected there but feels uncomfortable with the Islamic tradition in Turkey. Blue also gives an example by telling an old-forgotten story from Firdevsi's *Shehname* to Ka. It disappoints him that Turkey has fallen under the spell of the West and has removed all the grand old stories from children's textbook (*Snow*, p. 78). Moreover, Hande and also the other young girls also live in predicament and suffering after they are forced to uncover their head. Representing the suicide girls, Hande explains that they are scared if they cannot return to the

person they are now and even forgetting who they really are (*Snow*, pp. 123-124).

In my opinion, wearing or not wearing headscarf and embracing Western culture or preserving Islamic tradition is someone's personal right. No one can actually disturb someone's identity formation process. Moreover, Turkish people are free to embrace the identity which is considered as ideal for them. To overcome the ambivalence, the Turks need a liminal space to think, to reflect, and to negotiate the never ending ambivalence and predicament. In the liminal space—also called as the third space—even the authoritarian leaders do not have the right to interfere and disturb the identity formation processes. Turkish people should have the opportunity to choose their own identity whether being a Westerner, an Easterner, or hybrid. Additionally, it is okay to have a mix and hybrid identity.

In this case, I support Pamuk's agenda to bridge the East and West by connecting and mediating both of them through his works. I think that living with these two cultures is not a sin and Turkish people may embrace Western values without living their Islamic Ottoman tradition. In addition, I argue that it will be more dangerous if Turkey becomes totally East or totally West for those cultures can kill each other just like what happen in Kars. In *Snow*, it can be seen that the endless binary between East and West has led both sides to defeat one another. The people from Ankara force the young women to uncover their head while the religious revivalists kill the secularists to protect their religion from blasphemy. The director of the Institute of Education is killed by a man from Tokat because he wants to protect Islam from being the slaves of the West. Moreover, it is also because the director bans the girls who are refusing to take off their veil from the classroom (*Snow*, pp. 40-46).

I want underline that the ideal identity that is always problematized in *Snow* is not the ideal identity which is offered by the secularists or the religious revivalists. In

my opinion, it is the identity that is chosen by Turkish people. Thus, they should have the opportunity to choose their own identity and they are free to embrace Eastern, Western, or a hybrid identity. Lastly, the Kemalists or even the new Turkey's President, Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, should not politicise this practice. Furthermore, I argue that veil and the young girls who are forced to bare their heads in Pamuk strategy to deal with the predicament. Here, veil is contested and become the symbol of political Islam (*Snow*, p. 110). The young girls are dragged into bottom to cover or uncover their head by the political doctrine. Thus, Ka comes to Kars to investigate and try to solve this problem.

From the problem mentioned above, Pamuk wants to suggest a bridge which connect and mediate both souls in his novel. He tries to give the same portion, benefits, and even the irony that are experienced by the Kemalists and the fundamentalists. This can be though Blue—the leader of the militant political Islamists—who hates Western values but has Marlboro to smoke. In line with Pamuk, I argue that hybridity is the answer for this problem. Ka's journey in Kars shows how a man from a modern-secular family is also in his quest to find God. The snow reminds him of God, of the beauty and mystery of creation, and of the essential joy that is life (*Snow*, p. 96).

Additionally, through this novel, Pamuk also wants to remind his readers that they need to give their heart, thought, and sympathy towards the people in Kars rather than judgement. It is not only that the city is located in the poorest, the most remote, most forgotten, and most ignored part of the country but the problem on the search of identity is universal. As a result, it is still relevant to read, analyse, and discuss *Snow* though the novel was published in 2002. In my opinion, this novel may develop the empathy of our future generations because the problem is closely related to us. Furthermore, we can also learn to understand the pain, misery, and suffering of the oppressed.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the tension between the East and the West has been an endless story for Turkey. The Turks are facing the binary to live with the grandeur Western culture or to stay with the Ottoman culture. The predicament and the oscillation have brought the people in Kars in confusion and melancholy. Due to this condition Turkish people need a silent place to contemplate, reflect and consider their position. What happen with the young girls and the tension between the Kemalists and the fundamentalists are the result of the forced identity which also lead to melancholy and despair. Through the characters in *Snow*, Pamuk wants to emphasize his position for not taking sides and offer the third space to his readers. He tries to present the consequences in embracing one of the cultures in the same portion. He shows that living in Frankfurt will not bring happiness for Ka because he is rejected there. Oppositely, living in Kars is as hard as living in Frankfurt for the city is so poor and hopeless.

Theoretically, this research can be beneficial to overview theories on Orientalism and Postcolonialism, especially the problems on the forced modernization and the journey in finding Turkey's ideal identity. Practically, this study can be used by the *Contemporary Literary Criticism, Prose, and Thesis Writing* students to sharpen and train their critical thinking in analysing literary works from Orientalism perspective. Moreover, it can be used as a way to educate and raise the readers' awareness that protecting and giving the oppressed opportunities to speak is essential. Furthermore, it can also be a weapon to criticise the oppressor and can be employed to develop their critical thinking towards power relation practices. Lastly, the future researchers may discuss *Snow* as a World Literature work and explore more on how poetry, history, and symbols are used to problematize the binary opposition and oscillation.

Acknowledgments

We would like to express our gratitude to the Institute for Research and Community Service (LPPM) Universitas Sanata Dharma for funding this research through "Skema Penelitian Reguler" in February 2020. This research would not have been possible without the exceptional support.

References

- Akalin, E. (2007). "The Ottoman Phenomenon and Edward Said's Monolithic Discourse on the Orient". A journal compilation in the *Challenging the Boundaries* edited by Işıl Baş and Donald C. Freeman. New York: Rodopi, B.V.
- Bhabha, H.K. (1994). *The Location of Culture*. London: Routledge.
- Boyar, E. & Fleet, K. (2010). *A Social History of Ottoman Istanbul*. First Edition. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Eder, R. (2001, September 2). Heresies of the Paintbrush. *New York Times*. Retrieved May 20, 2020 from <<https://www.nytimes.com/2001/09/02/books/heresies-of-the-paintbrush.html>>.
- Fajar, M. (2013). Secularism in Pamuk's *Snow*: A Postcolonialism Study. *OKARA*, 1(8).
- Gökberk, Ü. (2008). "Beyond Secularism: Orhan Pamuk's *Snow* and the Contestation of 'Turkish Identity' in the Borderland", *Konturen* 1.
- Göknar, E. (2006). Orhan Pamuk and the 'Ottoman' Theme. *World Literature Today*, 80(6), 37.
- Huddart, D. (2006). *Homi K. Bhabha*. New York: Routledge.
- Jardine, L. & Brotton, J. (2000). *Global Interests: Renaissance Art between East and West*. London: Reaktion Books Ltd.
- Kholisah, S., Miftahul H., & Lusi S. (2017). Moslem Women's Resistance against Secularist's Domination In Orhan Pamuk's *Snow* Novel. *Edulitics Journal*, 2(1).

- Lou, C. (2011). Mimicry and Its Discontents: Examining Bhabha's Multiculturalism as Mimicry and Hybridity. *Student Pulse*, 3(10), 1.
- Loomba, A. (2005). *Colonialism/Postcolonialism*. Second Edition. Oxon: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group.
- Makandar, M. (2017). Orhan Pamuk's *Snow*: a Symbol of Feminist Struggle. *Epitome*, 3(11).
- Nandy, A. (1983). *The Intimate Enemy: Loss and Recovery of Self under Colonialism*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Pamuk, O. (2005). *Snow*. New York: Random House, Inc.
- (2006). *Istanbul: Memories and the City*, New York: Vintage International. trans. Maureen Freely.
- (2008). *Other Colours: Writing on Life, Art, Books, and Cities*. London: Faber and Faber Limited. trans. Maureen Freely.
- Said, E. (2003). *Orientalism*. London: Penguin Books, Ltd.